



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Journal of Experimental Agriculture International</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_51228
Title of the Manuscript:	Olfactory attraction of banana tree (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) to banana genotypes inoculated with entomopathogenic fungus
Type of the Article	Short Research Article

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



[SDI Review Form 1.6](#)

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	The manuscript is well-thought-out, however in its development it still has aspects that need to be improved before it can be considered for publication.	
<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments	<p><b>Title</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The term "banana tree" refers the insect but is confused. I suggest to change it by banana weevil, beetle, root or good borer, etc</li> </ol> <p><b>Abstract</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2. Complete the ubication of the work: Bananeiras – PB (Brazil)</li> <li>3. In the parentheses specify the name of the four banana varieties</li> <li>4. <b>Throughout ALL the text</b> review that scientific names are in italic letter</li> <li>5. I suggest chancing the syntaxis of the phrase: "The application of the fungus <i>Beauveria bassiana</i> on banana baits does not interfere with the (odour conditions) exerted . . . ."</li> </ol> <p><b>Keywords:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>6. The term Coleobrocas looks a local term for weevil or borer. I suggest changing it.</li> </ol> <p><b>Introduction</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>7. I suggest complement the background with a reference that document odour changes when a biological control agent (fungus or others) was applied in a crop in order to justify the second stage of the study.</li> </ol> <p><b>Material and Methods</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>8. If you have the data, mentioned hoy many insects were captured for study and the sex proportions</li> <li>9. Line 52, write 05 with letters (five).</li> <li>10. Line 56, change coleobroca term by weevil or borer</li> <li>11. Line 63, banana tree looks like the plant, I suggest banana weevil, borer or beetle.</li> <li>12. Line 72, change the term "verify" (it looks that is already done) by the term "measure" or "evaluate".</li> <li>13. Line 76, how much time the tissues were dipped in solution?</li> <li>14. Line 84, I believed the phrase "which is composed by the formula: <math>X^2 = \frac{(O-E)^2}{E}</math>" can be omitted.</li> <li>15. During the text is well described the characteristics of the four branch olfactometer besides the reference (Botelho). I suggest to erase the figure 1.</li> <li>16. The names of the genotypes sometimes are in upper case in others in lower case. Uniformize text.</li> </ol> <p><b>Results</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>17. In <b>Tables</b> is other a different term "pseudocaule" instead of "pseudostem". Uniformize text.</li> <li>18. As the insect is the same and just one, erase the first column of "insect".</li> <li>19. In my opinion the chi square analysis is too spread in the first four tables. I suggest present these data in one or two tables (pseudostem and rizoma).</li> <li>20. Line 114, check the term "Pto" and change the upper case of "Preference".</li> <li>21. Line 119, change the upper case of "Preference".</li> </ol> <p><b>Discussion</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>22. Line 147, the term "banana broth", is not so clear. Try to find a synonym.</li> </ol>	



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

	<p>Conclusion 23. Add terms to clarify the phases “plant tissues analyzed have a /diferential) olfactory influence” and “The Nanica banana plantation is the most (attractive) to Insect”.</p> <p>References 24. Number 2, separate the terms field-as 25. In general, write scientific names in italic letters.</p>	
<b>Optional/General</b> comments	The main change is related with the format of the tables in order to concentrate the results	

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b><i>Felipe Tafoya</i></b>
Department, University & Country	<b><i>Autonomous University of Aguascalientes, Mexico</i></b>