



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_51348
Title of the Manuscript:	Structure and successional classification of the shrub-arboreal component in a remnant of Atlantic Forest, Northeastern Brazil
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



[SDI Review Form 1.6](#)

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	<p>ABSTRACT</p> <p>The methodology lacks an experimental design, also lacks statistical analysis. The abstract does not clearly mention the measured variables.</p> <p>MATERIALS AND METHODS</p> <p>Study area</p> <p>The study area lacks information on the types and characteristics of soil Likewise altitude information.</p> <p>The methodology is deficient from the point of view of experimental design, because does not present the sampling design and no adequate forest inventory design.</p> <p>RESULTS & DISCUSSION</p> <p>Fifth paragraph: Change "E. ovata according to [18] is an initial secondary species" to "E. ovata according to Lorenzi, [18] is an initial secondary species".</p> <p>The results on the structural composition in terms of species so the same results on the affinity coefficient (frequency, dominance and abundance) lack of calculating importance value of species recorded in the study area.</p> <p>The results corresponding to figure 1 on "distribution of the number of shrub-arboreal individuals by height classes" lack the statistical support.</p> <p>Figure 2. Distribution of shrub-arboreal individuals by diameter class centers (cm) in the edge and interior environments of urban forest reserve, presents very spliced results therefore requires modification.</p> <p>The results on: a) The highest percentages of total natural regeneration per height class (TNR); b) percentages of relative natural regeneration in the FSC, were not compared with similar results from other authors.</p> <p>In short, the results were presented and interpreted without any statistical support. We recommend adding to both the experimental design methodology as the corresponding statistical analysis.</p>	
Minor REVISION comments	<p>Add the following words to the Keywords: Structure, successional Classification.</p> <p>INTRODUCTION</p> <p>Provide more information on the structural dynamics and successional process of the shrub-arboreal. It is important to present the information on the anthropogenic effect</p>	



SDI Review Form 1.6

	(human intervention) on the dynamics and structure of the forest. Change "located under the coordinates 8°04'44.5"S and 35°01'23.0"W," to "located under the coordinates 8°04'44.5"S latitude and 35°01'23.0"W longitude,"	
Optional/General comments		

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Rahim Foroughbakhch
Department, University & Country	University of Nuevo León, Mexico