



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Asian Journal of Research in Agriculture and Forestry</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJRAF_47776
Title of the Manuscript:	Maternal effects (dormancy and) germination: Variation among crop years from a clonal seed orchard
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<p>The paper is important because it provides information on how maternal characteristics influence the germination of Pinussylvestris seeds.</p> <p>The title of the work should be modified since it is not indicated that the studies are carried out on Pinussylvestris seeds.</p> <p>The results are very well presented in a clear and simple way both in the text and in the tables and figures.</p> <p>The results are very well presented in a clear and simple way both in the text and in the tables and figures. In these there are no evaluations of the characteristics of the mother plant that could affect the germination of the seeds, as it is referred to in the discussion and according to what the title of the work expresses.</p> <p>According to the results, the differences are attributed to variations in environmental conditions between years, mainly precipitations and temperature.</p>	
<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments	<p>The investigation is very complete, it is very well conducted, it contributes a great quantity of relevant information which is correctly analyzed.</p> <p>The only thing that is not interpreted from the paper is the title of it which should be modified since the effects of the mother plant on the germination of the seeds are not evaluated.</p> <p>Because of this, some statements in the discussion should also be reviewed, it would be important to synthesize them and include a section of conclusions highlighting the most important results of the research.</p>	
<b>Optional/General</b> comments		



[SDI Review Form 1.6](#)

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Martín María Silva Rossi</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Argentina</b>