



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Asian Journal of Agricultural Extension, Economics &amp; Sociology</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJAEES_46730
Title of the Manuscript:	Time Series Analysis and Forecasting of Oilseeds Production in India – An Application of ARIMA and GMDH-Neural Network
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	1)	
<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments	Author has provide supporting recent statistics for all the sentence with authenticated source. For example: "Oilseed crops play the second most important role in the Indian agricultural economy next to food grains in terms of area (what is the area) and production (what is the production)." In which year? What is the source for the same. Similarly there is lot of sentence which needs supporting statistics and source.	Statistical data are included as per reviewer's suggestions
<b>Optional/General</b> comments	<p>short-term forecasting: What do you mean by short-term forecasting, I mean to ask author has forecasted for 5 years, is 5 year is short term? Can we forecast 5 data point using ARIMA?</p> <p>Data source: Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare, Govt. of India. <b>I am not sure whether they will provide data. They may provide using external source. If yes, author has to cote the original sources</b></p> <p>Uniformity in writing formulas and equations are missing.</p> <p>Unit of the values can modified for simplicity. Example: 30062 thousand tonnes&gt;&gt; can be converted to lakh tonnes</p> <p><math>Y_t = 6677.04 + 1.036 Y_{t-15} + 0.005 Y_{t-23}</math>: is it MLR where 6677.04 is a, 1.036 is b1 and 0.005 b2.? Can you calculated the t value for the coeff's?</p>	<p>We have used 50 years data for time series Analysis and forecasted 5 data points from years 51 to 55. We are calling this short-term forecasting. ARIMA models are being used for Short term forecasting.</p> <p>Data source: Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare, Govt. of India....link is as follows (<a href="http://eands.dacnet.nic.in/latest_20011.htm">http://eands.dacnet.nic.in/latest_20011.htm</a>)</p> <p>Uniformity in equations has been brought in as per reviewer's suggestions</p> <p>Thousand tonnes may be converted into lakh tonnes or million tonnes. Our official data has used 'thousand tonnes' as unit of measurement. Hence, the results that we have obtained are expressed in 'thousand tonnes' and the scale of diagrams are also in thousand tonnes. It is therefore extremely difficult to convert in lakhs tonnes especially in diagrams.</p> <p>Though the point is valid, the output here is GMDH shell Ds software oriented output. Hence, there is no t- value</p>



[SDI Review Form 1.6](#)

**PART 2:**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	