



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Research
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJFAR_47388
Title of the Manuscript:	THE EFFECT OF PARTIAL REPLACEMENT OF FISHMEAL WITH <i>Citrullus lanatus</i> AND <i>Moringa oleifera</i> SEED MEALS ON GROWTH PERFORMANCE OF <i>Clarias gariepinus</i> (Burchell, 1822) JUVENILES
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link: (<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	Dissolve oxygen (mg/l) 4.42±0.10a level is low. What is the optimum level for this species?? Treatment groups weights are not homogenous and they are statistically different to your mean initial weight values. In a study starting in this way, comparison will not be very consistent. Hence, the poor growth recorded in fish fed with <i>Citrullus lanatus</i> seed meal may be caused by the presence of these anti-nutritional factors [28]. (Which are the anti-nutritional factors in <i>Citrullus lanatus</i> seed meal ?) The comparison with the other studies conducted in the discussion on growth parameters is almost non-existent. There is no clear information about the future using of raw materials in feeds.	
Minor REVISION comments	"Conventional ingredients used in fish feed are in high demand for human consumption and their yield are currently being affected by climate change, hence out of concern for and the implications for food security as well as water and land use, there is urgent need to get local materials especially agricultural by-products of lower price to replace these costly feed materials." (Any references ??) However, the unavailability and affordability of adequate fish feed has significantly affected the development of aquaculture in Nigeria. (Any references ??) The costs and average prices of these raw materials can be given in the introduction in table. Introduction section can be slightly shortened and the repeating parts can be removed The juveniles of <i>Clarias gariepinus</i> for this research were obtained from Arazu's fish farm, Awka, Anambra State. (Where is the Anambra State?) The mean weight gain of the fish in the four treatments (T1-18.36±1.86, T2-17.21±3.3.4, T3-21.32±1.96 and T4-18.39±0.37) revealed that T3 (21.32±1.96) had highest mean weigh gain though not significantly different (P>0.05) from others. (Not necessary) The mean Length Increase was not significantly different (P>0.05) among the four feed types. They all portray good length increase. (Any studies like for length increase ?) They all portray good weight increase. (Are there any similar studies ?)	ALL CORRECTIONS WELL EFFECTED
Optional/General comments	Trial group names are complicated and mixed numbers in the text. You can use for treatment names like I or A,B,C,D or etc.	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)	