



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	European Journal of Nutrition & Food Safety
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JSRR_44307
Title of the Manuscript:	HEAVY METALS CONTAMINATION AND POTENTIAL HUMAN HEALTH RISK VIA CONSUMPTION OF VEGETABLES FROM SELECTED COMMUNITIES IN ONELGA, RIVERS STATE, NIGERIA
Type of Article:	Review Paper (in fact this is a Research Article)

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
<p>1. Authors replied- "There is a reference material digested with same procedure. This was clearly referenced in the digestion"- but I did not find it in the revised manuscript. If so, author(s) need to add the details of certified reference material (CRM) along with % recovery of metals.</p> <p>2. Incase of THQ:</p> <p>a) Oral reference dose use for arsenic (As) is incorrect, as a result calculation of THQ values for As is also questionable. Author(s) are requested to go through the following 2 links, and re-calculate their data accordingly- https://cfpub.epa.gov/ncea/iris/iris_documents/documents/subst/0278_summary.pdf Or, https://www.atsdr.cdc.gov/toxprofiles/tp2-c8.pdf</p> <p>b) In methodology authors quoted "ED is the exposure duration (56 years, equivalent to the average lifetime of the Nigerian population" and "ATn is average exposure time for non-carcinogens in days (156 x 56)" that means they did not consider childhood (4-6 yrs, when babies did not eat vegetables) to calculate the THQ. If so, authors need to consider the point and accordingly deduct this period from ED to get more authentic THQ for each metals.</p> <p>3. In calculation of carcinogenic risk, authors use CSFing (ingestion cancer slope factor) for Pb=0.0085, Cd=0.38, Ni=0.91, and As=1.5; which requires reference(s).</p> <p>4. Results, Discussion and Conclusion sections need to revise particularly for As.</p> <p>5. References should be written following the journal instruction and same style should be followed throughout the section. References 1-3 are similar to 4-5 (authors name & style, journal name & style, and others). Reference 16 is incomplete.</p>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Zakir Hossen
Department, University & Country	Bangladesh Agricultural University, Bangladesh