



SDI Review Form 1.6

| | |
|--------------------------|--|
| Journal Name: | Asian Journal of Geological Research |
| Manuscript Number: | Ms_AJGER_45925 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Stable Isotope Geochemistry and Ore Genesis of Ishiagu Galena-Sphalerite Mineralization, Southeastern Nigeria. |
| Type of the Article | |

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link: (<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

PART 1: Review Comments

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|-------------------------------------|---|---|
| Compulsory REVISION comments | <p>My opinion is that stable isotope data in this paper point towards mixing between sediment-derived brines (from underlying mineralized sedimentary unit?) and some metamorphic or even (to a certain extent) granitic fluids. Figure 5 illustrates this point of view quite well where C-O data form a mixing line between mantle (igneous?) and seawater (essentially sedimentary) values.</p> <p>I suggest that authors exploit this idea a little bit further and make an acknowledgement in their discussion section that this is a possibility.</p> | |
| Minor REVISION comments | Please check references in the text. They do not always correspond to the reference in the Reference list. | |
| Optional/General comments | | |

PART 2:

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--|---|---|
| Are there ethical issues in this manuscript? | (If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details) | |

Reviewer Details:

| | |
|----------------------------------|--------------------|
| Name: | Pavel Kepezhinskas |
| Department, University & Country | USA |