

**CONCENTRATION OF HEAVY METALS (Cd, Co, Cr, & Fe) IN SOIL
AND EDIBLE VEGETABLES IN OBUDU URBAN AREA OF CROSS
RIVER STATE, NIGERIA.**

ABSTRACT

The soil and edible vegetable samples were collected from Obudu Urban Area of Cross River State and were digested and analyzed for the Cd, Co, Cr, and Fe (heavy metals) concentration using Atomic Absorption Spectrometer (AAS) in the University of Calabar Laboratory. The eight vegetables considered for the study were *Amaranthus spp.*, *Corchorus olitorius*, *Murraya koenigii*, *Ocimum grattissimum*, *Solanum melongena*, *Talinum triangulare*, *Telferia occidentalis* and *Vernonia amygdalina*. The results showed that the mean concentration of the metal in the soil in mgkg^{-1} ranged from (0.004-0.0048) and (0.005-0.046) in rainy and dry seasons respectively for Cd, (0.004-0.025) and (0.006-0.016) in rainy and dry season respectively for Cr, and (0.112-0.173) and (0.116-0.151) in rainy and dry season respectively for Fe. The mean concentration accumulated by the vegetables and that present in the soil was in the order: Fe > Cd > Cr > Co. These results suggest that there is no significant difference between the amount of metals in the soil or that accumulated by the vegetables in rainy and dry seasons of the year. Also the amount of metals accumulated by most of the vegetables was directly proportional to the amount present in the soil where they are planted. The bioaccumulation ratios were all less than 1. These results

Comment [CRL1]: What was responsible for this outlier?

Comment [CRL2]: Where is Cobalt? Below detection?

indicate that the concentration of Cd, Co, Cr, & Fe in the soil and vegetables were still low and within the permissible limits of WHO/FAO. Thus, the consumption of the vegetables in the area may not cause any harm for now.

Keywords: Concentration, Heavy metals, soil, edible vegetables.

Introduction

A heavy metal has been described as a member of a loosely defined subset of elements that exhibit metallic properties (Wikipedia free encyclopedia). Examples of these elements are transition metals, some metalloids, lanthanides and actinides. According to Duffus [1], it is a general collective term which applies to the group of metals and metalloids with atomic density greater than 4gcm^{-3} . They are widely recognized as widespread contaminants of land and fresh water ecosystems. Cadmium (Cd), Cobalt (Co), Chromium (Cr), and Iron (Fe) among others belong to this group of elements. They are used to produce many household goods like cooking utensils, alloys, electrical wires/appliances, magnets/electromagnets etc. which are later discarded as waste. Based on their toxic or poisonous effect at high doses and their contamination of food plants and animals when present in the soil or water environments, they have recently attracted the attention of many researchers worldwide as food safety and quality is a matter of public interest. Hence, several researchers have been carried out on heavy metals by researchers like Kanake [2],[3],[4],[5],[6],[7],[8] etc. most of which were within the acceptable

Comment [CRL3]: This is enough as a reference. Kindly refer properly. This equates to an anonymous.

Comment [CRL4]: No reference

Comment [CRL5]: Where are the references to this assertion?

limits. In their various localities to ascertain their food and environment quality/safety. Abdolatif [9] have reported that heavy metals are the major contaminating agents of our food and a problem of our environment.

Comment [CRL6]: There is no communication here. What do you mean?

Comment [CRL7]: What is this?

Moreover, Khan [10] has opined that the consumption of contaminated vegetables constitutes an important route or animal and human exposure to heavy metals. Halwell [11] have earlier stated that the nutritional value of vegetables depends on the growing method and the quality of the soil because when vegetables are grown in contaminated soils, like those polluted with heavy metals; their nutritional value will be reduced as pollutants from the soil will be accumulated by the vegetables. Thus, nutritionally and medicinally valuable as vegetables are, they should not be planted on soils contaminated with hazardous waste like heavy metals which can affect the health of human negatively when they consume these vegetables and accumulate this poisonous substances in high doses. Consequently, the aim of this study is to determine the concentration of some heavy metals (Cd, Co, Cr, & Fe) in the soil and edible vegetables in the study area (Obudu) and ascertain the soil and vegetable quality with respect to heavy metal pollution.

Comment [CRL8]: Do you mean 'for'?

Comment [CRL9]: Rephrase this and let it communicate well

Comment [CRL10]: These not This

Obudu urban area is characterized with mountainous land forms, hills and rocks which make it a good haven for quarry activities during road construction in the State. Besides, the people engaged in both subsistence and commercial farming, growing rice, cassava, yam, cocoa in large quantities as well as

vegetables for consumption as food and medicine. This often results in the use of insecticides, herbicides and other agrochemicals. By its location, it is a major link to the northern part of the country and most times experience heavy vehicular traffic.

Moreover, the inhabitants of the area practice rotational waste dump sites around their premises and later plant vegetables in old waste dump sites with a view to tap the compost for good yield even though wastes were disposed there indiscriminately. All these characteristics/features together with erosion during the rainy season make heavy metal contamination of the area inevitable. Hence, there is need to ascertain the vegetables and soil quality with respect to heavy metals pollution.

Materials and Methods

Sampling and sample pre-treatment: forty soil samples and vegetables were collected randomly at different locations within Obudu urban area and the closest neighborhood. The soil samples were collected at the root level of the vegetables at the depth of about 12 to 15 cm, and at the same time the edible vegetables were collected and wrapped separately with identification labels before taking them to the laboratory.

The edible vegetables considered for this study, and were planted in each of the forty soil samples include: *Amaranthus spp* (Green vegetable), *Corchorus olerius* (Ewedu), *Murraya koenigii* (Curry leaf), *Ocimum grattissimum* (scent leaf), *Solanum melongena* (egg plant leaf), *Telfairia occidentalis* (pumpkin), *Talinum, triangulare* (water leaf) and *Vernonia amygdalina* (Bitter

Comment [CRL11]: State the quantity of sample obtained.

Comment [CRL12]: At what distance to Obudu

Comment [CRL13]: What type of wrapper (plastic, paper, Alumin

leaf). They are commonly used for food and medicinal purposes in the area. The samples were collected between January and March for the dry season and between July and September for the rainy season. The vegetable samples were washed with distilled water and oven-dried at 80-85 °C for about 2 hours. Each dried sample was ground into powder, sieved with 0.3 mm sieve and stored in a labeled plastic jar with cap. The soil sampled was also oven-dried, ground into fine powder and homogenized with pestle and mortar, sieved and stored in labeled plastic jars separately.

Digestion of samples: vegetable samples were digested following the procedure of Sobukola [12] thus: 1.0 g of each sample was placed in a beaker and 20 cm³ of concentrated (HCl), 10 cm³ of concentrated HNO₃ and 5 cm³ of H₂SO₄ were added. After volatiles were removed, the beaker was heated in a fume cupboard for about 30 minutes. The digested sample was removed and allowed to cool.

De-ionized water was added to the digest and made up to 100 cm³ in a volumetric flask. The solution was stirred and filtered to obtain the supernatant liquid ready for heavy metals analysis. Similarly the soil samples were digested following the procedure of Akan [13] thus: 2.0 g of each soil sample powder was weighed into an acid washed beaker. 20 cm³ of aqua regia (mixture of HCl and HNO₃, in the ratio 3:1) was added to the sample in the beaker. The beaker was covered with a clean dry watch glass and heated at 90% for about 2 hours; the beaker was removed, allowed to cool, washed together with the watch glass using de-ionized water into a volumetric flask and made-up to 100 cm³ solution. The solution was filtered and supernatant liquid solution was used for heavy metal analysis.

Element Analysis: the soil and vegetable samples were analyzed for Cd, Co, Cr and Fe using a VGP 210 (BUCK Scientific) Model Atomic Absorption

Comment [CRL14]: What part of the vegetable were used? Whole or leaves or stem or root?

Comment [CRL15]: Kindly report this well

Comment [CRL16]: The cooling was done where, using what?

Comment [CRL17]: ?????

Spectrometer (AAS) at the following wavelengths: Cd (228.9nm), Co (240.7nm), Cr (357.0nm) and Fe (248.0nm).

Calculations: the bioaccumulation ratio which is the ratio of the concentration of the heavy metal or pollutant in the vegetable shoot or leaf to its concentration in the soil (where the vegetable is planted) was calculated thus:

$$\text{Bioaccumulation ratio} = \frac{C_{mp}}{C_{ms}}$$

Where C_{mp} is the concentration of heavy metal (pollutant) in vegetable or plant and C_{ms} is the concentration of the same metal in the soil.

Statistical Analysis: The data collected was analyzed using SPSS version 20. The data were expressed in terms of descriptive statistics and figures were presented with mean values of triplicates. Significance test was also computed using paired t-test at $P < 0.05$ for dry and rainy season data in order to check whether there was any significant difference.

Comment [CRL18]:

Comment [CRL19]: Were analyzed

Results: The mean heavy metal concentration in mgkg^{-1} (dry weight) in the soil and vegetables during the rainy and dry season have been presented in Tables 1 and 2 respectively, while the bioaccumulation ratios of the vegetables have been presented in Tables 3 and 4 for the both seasons.

Comment [CRL20]: Both seasons

Table 1: Mean concentration of Cd, Co, Cr, & Fe in mgkg^{-1} (dry weight) in the soil and vegetables during the rainy season in Obudu.

Vegetable	Cd	Co	Cr	Fe
-----------	----	----	----	----

Comment [CRL21]: Align this table

<i>Amarathus spp</i>	0.013± 0.001	ND	0.008±0.002	0.108±0.005
Soil	0.048±0.003	ND	0.013±0.003	0.148±0.035
<i>Corchorus olitorius</i>	0.011±0.002	ND	0.009±0.005	0.094±0.053
Soil	0.031±0.003	ND	0.013±0.007	0.173±0.011
<i>Murraya koenigii</i>	0.010±0.002	ND	0.009±0.003	0.097±0.030
Soil	0.035±0.002	ND	0.012±0.006	0.146±0.010
<i>Ocimum grattissimum</i>	ND	ND	0.002±0.002	0.066±0.048
Soil	0.003±0.001	ND	0.004±0.003	0.152±0.069
<i>Solanum melongena</i>	0.010±0.002	ND	0.010±0.003	0.089±0.038
Soil	0.025±0.002	ND	0.025±0.002	0.142±0.030
<i>Talinum triangulare</i>	0.004±0.001	ND	0.002±0.002	0.073±0.038
Soil	0.016±0.003	ND	0.004±0.003	0.131±0.051
<i>Telferia occidentalis</i>	0.003±0.001	ND	0.003±0.001	0.091±0.019
Soil	0.005±0.002	ND	0.007±0.001	0.135±0.053
<i>Vernonia amygdalina</i>	0.006±0.002	ND	0.010±0.003	0.101±0.052
Soil	0.014±0.003	ND	0.017±0.002	0.112±0.044

Values reported in mean ± SD format with N=3, ND – Not Detected.

Table 2: Mean concentration of Cd, Co, Cr, & Fe in mgkg⁻¹ (dry weight) in the soil and vegetables during the dry season in Obudu.

Vegetable	Cd	Co	Cr	Fe
------------------	-----------	-----------	-----------	-----------

<i>Amarathus spp</i>	0.017±0.001	ND	0.009±0.002	0.103±0.010
Soil	0.046±0.002	ND	0.013±0.002	0.137±0.027
<i>Corchorus olitorius</i>	0.013±0.001	ND	0.009±0.005	0.091±0.057
Soil	0.032±0.002	ND	0.012±0.006	0.158±0.010
<i>Murraya koenigii</i>	0.010±0.002	ND	0.007±0.006	0.094±0.026
Soil	0.033±0.003	ND	0.012±0.004	0.140±0.007
<i>Ocimum grattissimum</i>	ND	ND	ND	0.063±0.049
Soil	0.002±0.002	ND	ND	0.151±0.072
<i>Solanum melongena</i>	0.011±0.001	ND	0.008±0.003	0.090±0.018
Soil	0.025±0.001	ND	0.011±0.002	0.135±0.014
<i>Talinum triangulare</i>	0.006±0.002	ND	ND	0.062±0.051
Soil	0.015±0.002	ND	ND	0.129±0.048
<i>Telferia occidentalis</i>	ND	ND	0.003±0.001	0.087±0.022
Soil	0.005±0.001	ND	0.006±0.002	0.132±0.053
<i>Vernonia amygdalina</i>	0.009±0.001	ND	0.009±0.002	0.153±0.047
Soil	0.016±0.003	ND	0.016±0.002	0.116±0.038

ND- Not Detected, Values in mean ± SD format with N=3

Table3: Bioaccumulation ratios of Cd, Co, Cr, & Fe (heavy metals) in vegetables in Obudu in rainy season

Vegetables	Cd	Co	Cr	Fe	Comment [CRL22]: Was Cobalt not detected or not present?
<i>Amarathus spp</i>	0.271	Nil	0.615	0.730	
<i>Corchorus olitorius</i>	0.355	Nil	0.692	0.543	
<i>Murraya koenigii</i>	0.286	Nil	0.750	0.664	
<i>Ocimum grattissimum</i>	Nil	Nil	0.500	0.434	
<i>Solanum melongena</i>	0.400	Nil	0.818	0.627	
<i>Talinum triangulare</i>	0.250	Nil	0.500	0.557	
<i>Telferia occidentalis</i>	0.600	Nil	0.428	0.674	
<i>Vernonia amygdalina</i>	0.428	Nil	0.588	0.902	

Table 4: Bioaccumulation ratios of Cd, Co, Cr, & Fe (heavy metals) in vegetables in Obudu in dry season

Vegetables	Cd	Co	Cr	Fe
------------	----	----	----	----

<i>Amarathus spp</i>	0.370	Nil	0.692	0.752
<i>Corchorus olitorius</i>	0.406	Nil	0.750	0.576
<i>Murraya koenigii</i>	0.303	Nil	0.583	0.671
<i>Ocimum grattissimum</i>	Nil	Nil	Nil	0.417
<i>Solanum melongena</i>	0.440	Nil	0.727	0.667
<i>Talinum triangulare</i>	0.440	Nil	Nil	0.481
<i>Telferia occidentalis</i>	Nil	Nil	0.500	0.659
<i>Vernonia amygdalina</i>	0.563	Nil	0.563	0.457

Discussion

The results in Table 1 and 2 showed that there is some level of heavy metals in the study area (Obudu), especially Cd, Cr, and Fe, and the edible vegetables have also accumulated some of these metals present in the soil. Cobalt (Co) was not detected in the soil or the vegetables and is considered in this study as a string variable. Probably, its concentration in the soil is still insignificant to be detected or available for the vegetables to accumulate at the moment. From the data, the mean concentration of Cd in the soil in mgkg^{-1} ranged from (0.004 – 0.048) and (0.005-0.046) for rainy and dry seasons respectively. Cr level in the soil in mgkg^{-1} ranged from (0.004 – 0.025) and (0.006 – 0.016) for the rainy and dry season respectively. The mean concentration of Fe in the soil ranged from (0.112 – 0.173) and(0.116 – 0.151)

Comment [CRL23]: This is a poor reporting style

for rainy and dry season respectively. This results shows that the metals availability in the soil was in the order Fe > Cd > Cr > Co. The results also revealed that there is no significant difference between concentration of the metals in the soil and vegetables for both seasons, implying that the source of these metals may not be from air pollution sources such as vehicular emissions or irrigation water sources used in dry season. Therefore, the source may be from indiscriminate disposal of waste containing these metals from industrial sewage, leachate from auto-mechanic workshops etc. or anthropogenic activities like quarrying and road construction among others.

Comment [CRL24]: These results

Comment [CRL25]: Where is the place of concentration difference due to dry and raining seasons variance? Kindly explain this.

The bioaccumulation ratios of the metals as shown in Tables 3 and 4 revealed the ratios of the concentration of metals in the vegetable to that present in the soil for the rainy and dry season respectively. The bioaccumulation ratio of Cd for the vegetables in both seasons ranged from (0.250-0.600) and (0.303 – 0.563) for rainy and dry seasons respectively. The ratio of Cr ranged from (0.425 – 0.8181) and (0.500 – 0.750) for rainy and dry seasons respectively. For Fe, it ranged from (0.434 – 0.902) and (0.417-0.752) for rainy and dry season respectively.

The bioaccumulation ratios of the metals were in the order shown below: for Cd, *T. occidentalis* > *V. amygdalina* > *S. melongena* > *C. olitorius* > *M. koenigii* > *Amarathus spp.* > *T. triangulare* > *O. graattissimum*, for Cr, *S. melongena* > *M. koenigii* > *C. olitorius* > *Amarathus spp.* > *V. amygdalina* > *O.*

grattissimum > *Amarathusspp.* > *T. occidentalis* > *C. olitorius* > *O. grattissimum* and for Fe, *V. amygdalina* > *Amarathus spp.* > *T. occidentalis* > *M. koenigi* > *S. melongena* > *T. triangulane* > *C. olitorius* > *O. granttisimum*.

These results also show that the amount of metals accumulated by most of the vegetables is directly proportional to the amount present in the soil. Bioaccumulation ratio is a dimensionless quantity or parameter which gives the ratio of the concentration of a pollutant (heavy metal) in a vegetable or plant to the concentration in the soil. It indicates the rate or extent of transfer of the pollutant or heavy metals from the soil to plant or vegetables. Plants or organisms with bioaccumulation ratios highly greater than 1 could be used for bioremediation of that pollutant from a highly contaminated area. This is achieved by growing such plants in a contaminated area till maturity when they are harvested and properly disposed repeatedly until the pollutant level in the soil is reduced. The bioaccumulation of these metals by vegetables depends on the amount of metal in the soil, its chemical form, the pH of the soil, its porosity which could determine their availability for the vegetables or plants. Shuman [14] and Kiekens [15] for instance have reported earlier that Zn availability to plants in the soil depends on its chemical form in the soil and the dynamic equilibrium among its different forms or fractions in the soil. Ngole [16] have also stated that the accumulation of Cr and Fe depends on the pH and their availability in acidic soil among other factors. Besides, earlier research by Free Library [17] in the area have revealed that soil is quite porous and acidic,

Comment [CRL26]: Did you obtain pH of the soil analyzed?

making the availability of the metals for accumulation by the vegetables possible. However, the concentration of Cd, Cr, and Fe in the soil is still low and the amount already accumulated by the edible vegetables is still very low and within the permissible limits of WHO/FAO. Therefore efforts has to be made by relevant government agencies to maintain this low concentration of the metals in the study area through public awareness of the effects of pollution and a periodic environmental monitoring and assessment of the metals concentration in the area.

Comment [CRL27]: Reference

CONCLUSION

The results of this study have shown that there is some level of Cd, Cr, and Fe in the soil, which have been accumulated by the edible vegetables in the area. The concentration of Co was not detected in the area and seems negligible at the moment. The level of the metals presents in the soil and vegetable are still very low and within the permissible limits of WHO/FAO. Thus, the concentration of these metals in the edible vegetables may not pose any health risk at the moment.

REFERENCES

1. Duffus, J. H. (2002). Heavy metal-A meaningless term? IUPAC Technical Report. *Pure and Applied Chemistry*, 74:798-807.
2. Kanake, T., Wansapala, J. & Gunarate, A. (2014). Heavy metal contamination in green leafy vegetables collected from selected Market sites of Piliyandala Area, Colombo District, Sri Lanka. *American Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 2(5):139-144.
3. Buteh, D.S., Chindo, I.Y., Ekanem, E.O., & Williams, E.M. (2013). Impact Assessment of Contamination pattern of solid waste dumpsites soil: A comparative study of Bauchi metropolis. *World Journal of Analytical Chemistry*, 1(4):59-62.
4. Harmanescu, M., Alda, L.M., Bordean, D.M., Gogosa, I. & Gergen, I. (2011). Heavy metals health risk assessment for population via consumption of vegetables grown in old mining area; a case study of Banat County, Romania. *Chemistry Central Journal*, 5:64; doi: 10.1186/1752-153x-5-64.
5. Suruchi, S. & Khanna, P. (2011). Assessment of heavy metals contamination in different vegetables grown in and around urban areas. *Research Journal of Environment and Toxicology*, 5:162-179.
6. Zhuang, P., McBride, M.B., Xia, H., Li, N. & Li, Z. (2009). Health risk from heavy metals via consumption of food crops in the vicinity of Daboashan mine, South China. *Science of the Total Environment*, 407(5):1551-1561.
7. Sanayei, U., Ismail, N. & Talebi, S.M. (2009). Determination of heavy metals in Zayandeh Road River, Isfahan-Iran. *World Applied Science Journal*, 6(9):1209-1214.

8. Yakubu, A., Tanko, U.M. & Dangoggo, S.M. (2011). The impact of man's activities on the heavy metals level in soils in Wuse District, Abuja, Nigeria. *De Chemica Sinica*, 2(6):181-184.
9. Abdollatiff, G., Aralan, A. M. Ahmad, M. T., Hoseni, A. M. & Karimaian, N. (2009). Solubility test in some phosphate rocks and their potential for direct application in soil. *World Applied Science, Journal* 6(2):182-192.
10. Khan, S. Cao, Q. Y. Z., Huang, Y. Z. & Zhu, Y. G. (2009). Health risk of heavy metals in contaminated soil and food crops, irrigated with waste water in Beijing, China. *Environmental pollution*, 124(3): 686-693.
11. Halwell, B. (2007). *Critical Issue Report: still no free lunch*. The organic center, www.organi-center.org (accessed July, 2014).
12. Sobukola, O. P., Adeniran, O. P., Odedara, A. A. & Kajihansa, O. E. (2010). Heavy metals level of some fruit and leafy vegetables from selected markets in Lagos, Nigeria. *African Journal of Food Science*, 4(2):389-393.
13. Akan, J.C., Abdulrahman, F. I., Sodipo, O. A. & Lange, A. G. (2010). Physicochemical parameter in soil and vegetable samples from Gongalon agricultural site, Maiduguri, Borno State, Nigeria. *Journal of American Science*, 12:78-88.
14. Shuman, L. M. (1991) *Micronutrients in Agriculture*. 2nd Ed. Madison, W. I., Soil society of America: Chemical forms of micro-nutrients in soil. USA, SSA, Book series.
15. Kiekens, L. (1990). *Zinc in: Alloway, B. J. (Editor), Heavy metals in soils*. New York, John Wiley & Sons.
16. Ngole, V. M. (2011). Using soil heavy metals enrichment and mobility to determine potential uptake by vegetables. *Plant soil Environment*. 57:75-80.
17. Free Library (2014). *Mineralogy and geochemical properties of some upland soils from different sedimentary formations in south-eastern Nigeria*. www.thefreelibrary.com (accessed July, 2015).