1 Employers' Perceptions about the employability of Technical,

2 Vocational Education and Training Graduates in Uganda

Denis Kintu^{1,*}, Kisilu. M. Kitainge², Ahmed Ferej²

¹Kyambogo University, P.O Box 1 Kyambogo-Uganda ²University of Eldoret, P.O. Box 1125-30100, Eldoret, Kenya

Author's contribution The authors designed, analyzed, interpreted and prepared the manuscript.

11 13 14

10

3

4 5 6

7

8 9

14 15

15 ABSTRACT 16

Aims: The study aimed at determining employers' perceptions about the employability of Technical, Vocational Education and Training (TVET) graduates in Uganda. Determining employability skills from the employer's perspective is crucial to develop these skills among the students while at the training institutions.

Study design: Survey.

Place and Duration of Study: Sample: Employers of TVET graduates in Uganda. Between February 2018 to August 2018.

Methodology: The study adopted and modified a SCANS (Secretary's Commission on Achieving Necessary Skills) questionnaire. Sample: The study involved 50 respondents selected from different employing organizations.

Results: The findings indicated that most employers agreed that the graduates possessed the basic skills (average mean=3.91), ICT skills (average mean=3.87), and interpersonal skills required for work (average mean=3.61). However, there were negative perceptions regarding their decision making (mean= 2.39), reasoning (mean=2.96), self-esteem (mean=2.92), sociability' (mean=2.90), integrity/honesty (mean= 2.60), money (mean=2.57), materials and facilities management (mean=2.67); understanding systems (mean=2.79), monitoring and correcting performance (mean=2.40), and improving systems (mean=2.24). Further, that most employers don't participate in curriculum design (50%).

Conclusion: TVET institutions should endeavor to improve on the negatively perceived aspects to instill the necessary employability skills among the graduates to make them readily employable.

17 Keywords: Perceptions; employability; graduates; employers

18 1. INTRODUCTION

19 **1.1 Technical, Vocational Education and Training (TVET): A Brief Overview**

At the beginning of the twenty-first century, demography, urbanization, globalization and technological and macroeconomic crises brought about considerable job challenges. New occupations demanded new skills and competencies and Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) and Skills Development (SD) systems were called upon to respond to these needs [1] The United Nations

Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) defined TVET as: " those aspects of the * Tel.: +256754034200.

25 educational process involving, in addition to general education, the study of technologies and sciences, in 26 order to attain knowledge, practical skills, and attitudes for employment in various sectors of economic 27 and social life" [2]. As an essential part of general education, TVET prepares individuals for effective 28 participation in the world of work, lifelong learning, responsible citizenship and promotion of sustainable 29 development [3]. Whereas general education makes one trainable, TVET makes one employable 30 because it provides appropriate skills for the job market [4]. TVET has further been identified as the type of education that prepares both young people and adults for work by providing them with knowledge, 31 32 skills and competencies for gainful employment, increased productivity and improved quality of life [5].

33 A distinct feature for TVET is that it can be provided at all stages of the learners. This makes it easy to not only respond to different skills needs of enterprises but also to training needs of learners from 34 35 different academic backgrounds and prepare them for gainful employment and sustainable livelihoods 36 [6]. Therefore, TVET is the type of education which offers individuals with skills, knowledge and attitudes 37 for employment in specific occupations [7]. A well-educated and well-trained population is crucial for the efficient acquisition, utilization, creation and dissemination of knowledge and skills that increase 38 39 productivity and economic growth [8]. The essential role of TVET in facilitating skills development for the 40 socio-economic and technological development of countries globally account for the increasing 41 importance that is being attached to TVET [7]. Therefore, an effective and successful TVET system is a 42 crucial pillar for a successful economy [9]. Quality TVET is therefore recognized to be vital for enhancing 43 economic competitiveness by contributing to the social inclusion, decent employment and income, and 44 poverty reduction [10]. The quality of a TVET system is therefore vital for spearheading industrial 45 development by providing vocational graduates who are creative and adaptable, understand products 46 and services, and are central to technological innovations and practice [11].

47 A Group of Twenty (G-20) training strategy, prepared by the International Labour Organization (ILO), 48 recognized the importance of developing a suitably skilled workforce. The strategy emphasized good 49 quality education, matching skills supply to future market demands, and enabling workers to adjust to changes in technology [12]. In 2007, the African Union (AU) drafted the strategy to revitalize TVET in 50 51 Africa. The report states that there is a fresh awareness among many African countries of the critical role 52 that TVET plays in the national development. It recommended that VET national objectives in member 53 countries be grouped into five specific areas that should be addressed by the syllabi: delivery of quality 54 TVET, graduates' employability, improvement of consistency and management by training providers, 55 promotion of life-long learning, and enhancing the status and attraction of vocational education [13]. There has been some noticeable improvements across most African states although quality provision 56 and relevance of such is still a concern [14]. 57

58 **1.2 Technical, Vocational Education and Training in Uganda**

In Uganda, Technical, Vocational Education and Training (TVET), is known as Business, Technical, Vocational Education and Training (BTVET). The most significant legal instrument guiding the policy formulation and reforms for this education sector is the BTVET act of 2008. According to this act the objective of BTVET is to provide relevant and quality knowledge, values and skills for purposes of academic progression and employment in the labour market to the larger number of persons in an affordable way, and to improve the productivity capabilities of the individuals and enhance employability [15].

The BTVET system comprises– public; private; and firm based training. There are 144 public institutions; about 600 private training service providers and an unknown number of apprenticeships and enterprise based training programmes operating in Uganda. The national vision is to develop a BTVET system that will enable greater access, and realization of the full potential of Uganda's human resources. For the benefit of the economy, Business, Technical, and Vocational Education and Training (BTVET) is capable of producing a competent and polyvalent workforce with practical work skills, entrepreneurship skills and orientation that are essential for employment [16].

* Tel.: +256754034200.

Over the last five years, all BTVET institutions have experienced increases in students' enrolment and the demand is continuing to rise. The demand for employment oriented skills training will therefore continue to raise both in the medium term and in the long run. In the light of all the above realities, BTVET needs appropriate recognition and support so that it can have a significant impact on poverty eradication within the context of the pro-poor economic growth strategy [17].

78 Realizing the importance of TVET in facilitating skills development for the socio-economic and 79 technological development, the Ugandan government has been at the forefront in advocating for reforms 80 in the BTVET education subsector. A 10-year BTVET strategic plan 2011-2020, launched in October 81 2012 and titled 'Skilling Uganda', emphasizes a more comprehensive system of skills development to 82 raise the quality and economic relevance of BTVET. The strategic plan targets to reform the way BTVET 83 programmes are delivered to different groups so as to improve the competences of graduates and make them competitive in the labour market [16]. The graduates should be competent enough to fit into 84 85 Uganda's labour market, which has had a shift in economic structure. The predominantly agricultural economy has steadily shifted to industry and services, tourism, construction, oil and gas. All these have 86 87 increased the demand for skills in the labour market [18]. However, it has been noted from different 88 studies that most graduates from training institutions fail to get absorbed into the Ugandan labour market 89 because their skills profile are ill-suited to find appropriate employment, yet opportunities do exist [19; 17; 90 20; 21; 22]. This was further confirmed by the Uganda Bureau of Statistics (UBoS) School-to-Work 91 Transition Survey (SWTS) carried out in 2015 which revealed that young persons with tertiary level of education had higher levels of unemployment (12 percent) than the national average (7 percent) [23]. An 92 93 example is that of the flower export enterprises. When these businesses began in Uganda, there was no 94 skilled labor to carry out the work, so employees were imported from Kenya [21]. Similar cases are found 95 in the hotel industry, oil and gas and the road construction sectors where most workers are foreign yet 96 Ugandan BTVET institutions produce many graduates in these fields annually. In 2007, UNESCO noted 97 that in almost all African countries, large numbers of graduates coming out of school system are 98 unemployed, although opportunities for skilled workers do exist in their economy [24]. The lingering 99 questions are, "Why is this so?"; "What are the employers' perceptions about the employability of TVET graduates in Uganda?" The study was conducted to address such questions. Identifying indicators for 100 employability skills from the employer's perspective is crucial to develop students' employability skills. 101 The education institutions must produce graduates who not only have technical skills but also 102 103 employability skills [25].

104 **1.3 Scope of the study**

105 The study was conducted between February, 2018 to August, 2018 and it was limited to only 106 engineering/technical fields in BTVET.

107 **1.4 Literature Review**

108 Several studies have been conducted about employers' perceptions about the employability of TVET 109 graduates.

In The Gambia, a tracer study of TVET graduates was carried out by the Educational Research Network
for West and Central Africa (ERNWACA) (2013) for the period (2009 – 2011). Views from a sample of 34
employers were sought in regard to their satisfaction about TVET graduates skills and performance level.
The employers noted that they had found the graduates' performance adequate, especially for those
graduates mainly working in the commercial sector. However, for those in the engineering and
construction sectors, the results were the opposite [26].

The Ministry of Higher Education of Malaysia (MOHE) (2009), carried out an overview about undergraduates' employability at a private university. The findings showed that undergraduates were all highly competent in possessing personal qualities and skills. However, there existed a mismatch between employers' and undergraduates' perception on skills such as critical analysis, planning, problem solving,

120 oral communication, decision making, and negotiation skills [27].

* Tel.: +256754034200.

A survey was carried out in 2010 by Flash Euro barometer covering all 27 European Union (EU) member states, regarding "Employers' perception of graduate employability". The survey provided insights into the needs and perceptions of graduate recruiters. Taking into account certain skills and abilities as "very important", employers highlighted the importance of teamwork (67%), and special sector skills such as, communication skills, computer skills, the ability to deal with a new situation, reading / writing ability, and problem solving skills all 58% -62% [28].

127 Furthermore, from the European Commission survey, when asked to name the two most important 128 challenges they faced in filling vacancies, almost half (47%) of graduate recruiters mentioned a shortage of applicants, in their country, with the right skills and capabilities; a somewhat smaller number of 129 130 respondents (43%) saw a difficulty in being able to offer a competitive starting salary as one of the two 131 main challenges (European Commission, 2010). These findings are in line with a World Bank report (2010), which noted that nowadays employers in many economies are seeking workers who possess 132 behavioral skills such as teamwork, diligence, creativity, and entrepreneurship. In addition workers need 133 personal attributes, like work ethics and problem- solving skills. Thirdly, workers are required to have 134 135 technical skills, e.g. dealing with corruption and bribery, as well as self- improvement skills such as self-136 worth, confidence and motivation which are essential to thrive in today's rapidly evolving, technologically-137 driven globalized economies [29].

138 In Bhutan, TVET is seen as a system to equip those cohorts of young people not only with vocational 139 skills but also with a broad range of knowledge, skills and attitudes indispensable for a meaningful 140 participation in work and life. The Royal Government of Bhutan aims for TVET to close the skills gap 141 between skills required by employers and those that employees have acquired [30]. In his research about 142 skills development in Bhutan, [30] concluded that the majority of the employers (more than 80%) agreed that industries require TVET graduates who possess a broad range of generic/employability skills rather 143 144 than only specialized/ technical skills and that generic/employability skills should be imparted in TVET 145 institutions. Employers expect graduates to be self-confident, able to solve problems and take practical decisions on their own. Besides, they valued creativity and innovativeness. She further found out the five 146 147 skills that employers considered important for the labour market as: being able to solve problems, being able to understand how ideas and systems are linked to each other, being able to work with other people 148 in teams, having a customer focus and being motivated. 149

In Tanzania, research shows huge divergence between the kind of graduates employers expect and those produced by colleges and universities as attested by public and private sectors [31]. He further quotes former Tanzanian president Dr. Jakaya Mrisho Kikwete who hinted that "many of the Tanzanian graduates are unemployable because they do not get the required skills needed by the markets inside and outside the country".

In Papua New Guinea, results from an investigation into a Vocational Education and Training (VET) model for secondary schools revealed that employers are interested in recruiting only those secondary or post-secondary school graduates who have proper qualifications with employability skills. Unless the students were given sufficient training in some of the employability skills and attributes, there is no guarantee of employment for the majority of secondary school graduates in Papua New Guinea. Students should acquire these employability skills and attributes at secondary level so that it would assist their smooth transition from school to further education/training and employment [32].

In Nigeria, [33] researched about employers' perception of the role of technical vocational education and training in sustainable development. The sample comprised of 84 indigenous and 72 multinational employers in the north-east geopolitical zone of Nigeria. To guide the study were two research questions and null hypotheses. The data was collected using a questionnaire and were analyzed using means and standard deviation and the t-test. They concluded that Nigerian employers are not satisfied with the Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) system in Nigeria.

In Togo, [34] researched about technical and vocational education stakeholders' perceptions on professional skills acquired in private "Brevet de Technicien Supérieur (BTS)" schools. One of their major findings revealed that eighty percent of the employers' expressed their dissatisfaction regarding implemented BTS curricula compared to the needs of the labor market. A large majority of respondents

* Tel.: +256754034200.

were unsatisfied (73% and 60% respectively), about the skills acquired by BTS graduates especially labor market expectations, and opportunities for professionals involved in the training process. They concluded that, employers believe that students' theoretical knowledge is not well understood and their practical abilities are not up to standard. This may result in BTS training being a way for students to gain a diploma of little use while the private BTS institutions are run as a business, rather than an educational institution which teaches theory and practical skills.

178 In Kenya, [35] researched about the perceptions of stakeholders of TVET in the micro and small 179 enterprises of motor vehicle service and repair industry. She found that although most employers agreed 180 that TVET is a necessary program for the country's industrial growth, others rated the success of the 181 program differently.

182

183 2. METHODOLOGY

184 The study adopted a descriptive survey design because it is used to describe the state of affairs, as it exists. It is used when collecting information about people's attitudes, opinions, habits or any of the 185 186 variety of education or social issues [36]. Many educational study approaches are descriptive because 187 they describe the conditions or existing relationships and practices that are happening [37]. The target 188 population comprised of 58 prominent employers of TVET graduates in Uganda. The sample size was 189 determined using Krejie and Morgans' table (1970). Accordingly, for a target population of 58, the sample 190 size was 50.The list of prominent employers was drawn up by the researchers from records of the Uganda bureau of statistics. The names of the companies were written on a piece of paper which was 191 192 then folded and put into a box. After a thorough shaking of the box, the researcher randomly picked the 193 papers and the names of the companies found were considered for the study. The respondents were then randomly selected from among the administrators and supervisors from these companies. The study 194 195 sought views from the employers in order to identify indicators for employability skills from the employer's perspective which are crucial to develop students' employability skills. The study adopted and modified a 196 SCANS (Secretary's Commission on Achieving Necessary Skills) guestionnaire which was developed in 197 198 the U.S.A. The SCANS questionnaire is made up of five competencies and a three-part foundation of skills and personal qualities needed for solid job performance. The SCANS questionnaire has been used 199 over time and it focuses on similar themes as many other employability skills measures. It was 200 considered valid and reliable because it has been extensively used for measuring competence. 201 202 Therefore, the researcher found it useful and reliable for determining basic skills and competences for 203 TVET graduates in Uganda. The researchers conveniently administered and followed up the 50 204 questionnaires which were distributed to the respondents to ensure that they were all properly filled and 205 returned. The data collected was analyzed using Statistical Package for Social Scientists (SPSS) version 206 20.

2073. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

208 3.1 Results

209 **3.1.2 Number of TVET graduates employed by the companies**

The first item on the questionnaire sought to know the number of TVET graduates employed in the companies or organizations of the respondents. Table 1 shows the findings.

- As indicated in table 1 above, out of the 50 companies or organizations from which data was gathered, 80% had less than 250 TVET graduates working them.
- 214
- 215

216

218

Percent Cumulative Percent
0.0 40.0
0.0 80.0
0.0 100.0

219

220 3.1.3 Ownership Structure of Employers' Companies/Organizations

The second item on the questionnaire sought to establish the ownership structure of employers' companies or organizations of the respondents. Table 2 shows the findings.

As indicated in table 2, out of the 50 companies or organizations from which data was gathered, 80% were privately owned and 20% were public enterprises.

225 Table 2: Ownership Structure of Employers' Companies/organizations

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
	Public	10	20.0	20.0	20.0
Valid	Private	40	80.0	80.0	100.0
	Total	50	100.0	100.0	

226 3.1.4 Main activities of the employers

The researchers sought to establish the main activities of the employers. The table 3 gives the main activities in which most TVET graduates were engaged:

As indicated in table 3, most TVET graduates were engaged in 'motor vehicles and motorcycles repair' (20%), 'manufacturing' (7%), and 'electricity and gas supply services' (6%).

Whereas 'professional, scientific and technical consultancy activities' (2%) and 'real estate management' (2%) were the activities in which fewer TVET graduates were engaged.

Table 3: Main activities of the employers

Frequency Percent Valid Percent Cumulative Percent

* Tel.: +256754034200.

	50	100.0	100.0	
Other service activities	7	14.0	14.0	100.0
activities	2	4.0	4.0	00.0
Real estate management	2	4.0	4.0	86.0
activities				
technical consultancy	2	4.0	4.0	82.0
Professional, scientific and				
services	6	12.0	12.0	78.0
Electricity and gas supply	0	10.0	10.0	70.0
motorcycle repair	10	20.0	20.0	66.0
Motor vehicle and				
-	4	8.0	8.0	46.0
-	3	0.0	0.0	30.0
	3	6.0	60	38.0
-	5	10.0	10.0	32.0
Transportation and storage	4	8.0	8.0	22.0
Ŭ				
	Building and road construction Water supply; sewerage, waste management activities Refrigeration and air conditioning services Motor vehicle and motorcycle repair Electricity and gas supply services Professional, scientific and technical consultancy activities Real estate management activities	Transportation and storage4Building and road5construction5Water supply; sewerage,3waste management3activities4Refrigeration and air4conditioning services10Motor vehicle and10motorcycle repair6Professional, scientific and2activities2Real estate management2activities2	Transportation and storage48.0Building and road construction510.0Water supply; sewerage, waste management36.0activities48.0Refrigeration and air conditioning services48.0Motor vehicle and motorcycle repair1020.0Electricity and gas supply services612.0Professional, scientific and technical consultancy24.0activities24.0Real estate management activities24.0	Transportation and storage48.08.0Building and road construction510.010.0Water supply; sewerage, waste management36.06.0activities48.08.0Refrigeration and air conditioning services48.08.0Motor vehicle and motorcycle repair1020.020.0Electricity and gas supply services612.012.0Professional, scientific and technical consultancy24.04.0activities24.04.0Real estate management activities24.04.0

3.1.5 Employers' rating of foundation skills and personal qualities required for work amongst TVET graduates

235 This section deals with the employers' rating of skills required for work amongst TVET graduates. It is 236 divided into eight sub-groups. The sub-groups were categorized according to SCANS eight specific skills and these were: basic skills; thinking skills; personal qualities; resource management skills; information 237 238 skills; interpersonal skills; system management and technology use. The responses were gathered using 239 a five point likert scale and were indicated by 'strongly agree', 'agree', 'not sure', 'disagree', and 'strongly disagree'. Scoring weights of 5, 4, 3, 2, and 1 were used for 'strongly agree', 'agree', 'not sure', 240 'disagree', and 'strongly disagree' respectively for statements favoring a rating regarding skills required 241 for work amongst TVET graduates. 242

The analysis of the employers' perception was done using mean and standard deviations. Standard deviation is the average spread of scores around the mean. According to [38], when the standard deviation is greater than the mean, then the mean is inappropriate as an illustrative measure of central tendency. Accordingly, for this study the values of the standard deviations are less than the mean values as indicated in the tables below, and hence, the mean is appropriate to measure the employers' rating of skills required for work amongst TVET graduates.

249 3.1.5.1 Basic Skills

The first item under this section on the questionnaire sought to find out the perception of the employers regarding the basic skills of TVET graduates. Table 4 shows the findings.

As indicated in table 4, all the items presented to the respondents rated above the average mean on the scale running from 1 to 5. This implies that the employers agreed that TVET graduates in Uganda possessed the basic skills required for work.

Statement	Strongly Agree		Agree		Not Si	Not Sure		Disagree		Strongly Disagree		Standard Deviation
	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%		
Reading	20	40.0	12	24.0	8	16.0	8	16.0	2	4.0	3.80	1.25
Writing	17	34.0	19	38.0	-	-	12	24.0	-	-	3.85	1.17
Arithmetic	18	36.0	29	58.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	4.38	.49
Mathematics	10	20.0	20	40.0	8	16.0	10	20.0	2	4.0	3.52	1.15
Listening	8	16.0	30	60.0	10	20.0	-	-	-	-	3.96	.62
Speaking	20	40.0	16	32.0	8	16.0	4	8.0	2	4.0	3.96	1.12

255 Table 4: Basic skills of TVET graduates (N=50)

256 **3.1.5.2** *Thinking Skills*

The second item under this section on the questionnaire sought to find out the perception of the employers regarding the thinking skills of TVET graduates. Table 5 below shows the findings.

As indicated in table 5, two items, that is, 'decision making' (2.39), and 'reasoning' (2.96) scored below the average mean value. The remaining four items namely, 'creative thinking' (3.83), 'Problem solving' (3.16), 'seeing things in the mind's eye' (3.38) and 'knowing how to learn' (3.06) were all rated above the mean average on the scale running from 1 to 5. This implies that the employers negatively perceived the decision making and reasoning skills of TVET graduates in Uganda.

264 Table 5: Thinking skills of TVET graduates (N=50)

Statement	Strono Agree		Agree		Not Su	Not Sure		Disagree		Strongly Disagree		Standard Deviation
	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%		
Creative thinking	-	-	39	78.0	8	16.0	-	-	-	-	3.83	.379
Decision making	8	16.0	-	-	-	-	35	70.0	5	10.0	2.39	1.22

* Tel.: +256754034200.

Problem solving	9	18.0	10	20.0	10	20.0	20	40.0	-	-	3.16	1.16
Seeing things in the mind's Eye	-	-	28	56.0	10	20.0	10	20.0	-	-	3.38	.82
Knowing how to learn	-	-	25	50.0	-	-	22	44.0	-	-	3.06	1.01
Reasoning	-	-	18	36.0	10	20.0	20	40.0	-	-	2.96	.89

265 3.1.5.3 Personal qualities

The third item under this section on the questionnaire sought to find out the perception of the employers regarding the personal qualities of TVET graduates. Table 6 shows the findings.

From issues presented to the respondents as indicated in table 6, two items, that is, 'responsibility' (3.31), and 'self-management' (3.10) scored above the average mean value. The remaining three items namely, 'self-esteem' (2.92), 'sociability' (2.90), and 'integrity/honesty' (2.60) were all rated below the mean average on the scale running from 1 to 5. This implies that the employers negatively perceived the self-esteem, sociability and integrity/honesty of TVET graduates in Uganda.

273 Table 6: Personal Qualities of TVET graduates (N=50)

Statement	Strong Agree	lly	Agree		Not Su	ure	Disag	ree	Strong Disag		Mean	Standard Deviation
	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%		
Responsibility	-	-	28	56.0	-	-	18	36.0	2	4.0	3.13	1.06
Self-Esteem	8	16.0	-	-	20	40.0	20	40.0	-	-	2.92	1.05
Sociability	-	-	-	-	20	40.0	10	20.0	5	10.0	2.90	.95
Self-Management	-	-	22	44.0	10	20.0	17	34.0	-	-	3.10	.89
Integrity/Honesty	-	-	9	18.0	16	32.0	21	42.0	4	8.0	2.60	.88

274 3.1.6 Employers' rating of the competencies required for work amongst TVET graduates

275 3.1.6.1 Resource management skills

The first item under this section on the questionnaire sought to find out the perception of the employers regarding the resource management skills of TVET graduates employed in the companies or organizations of the respondents. Table 7 shows the findings.

From issues presented to the respondents as indicated in table 7, two items, that is, 'time' (3.00), and 'human resources' (3.16) scored above the average mean value. The remaining two items, 'money' (2.57), and 'materials and facilities' (2.67) were rated below the mean average on the scale running from 1 to 5.

282 This implies that the employers were satisfied with the TVET graduates' time management and human

283 resources skills. However, they had concerns regarding money, materials and facilities management by

284 TVET graduates in Uganda.

Statement	Strong Agree	lly	Agree		Not Sı	ıre	Disagı	ree	Strong Disagi		Mean	Standard Deviation
	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%		
Time	-	-	23	46.0	7	14.0	17	34.0	3	6.0	3.00	1.03
Money	-	-	9	18.0	10	20.0	30	60.0	-	-	2.57	.79
Materials and Facilities	-	-	16	32.0	-	-	32	64.0	-	-	2.67	.95
Human Resources	9	18.0	10	20.0	10	20.0	20	40.0	-	-	3.16	1.16

285 Table 7: Resource management skills of TVET graduates (N=50)

286 3.1.6.2 Information skills

The second item under this section on the questionnaire sought to find out the perception of the employers regarding information and communication skills of TVET graduates employed in the companies or organizations of the respondents. Table 8 shows the findings.

From issues presented to the employers as indicated in table 8, all the four items were rated above the mean average on the scale running from 1 to 5. This implies that the employers agreed that TVET graduates in Uganda possessed the information and communication skills required for work.

293 Table 8: Information and communication skills of TVET graduates (N=50)

Statement	-	Strongly Agree		Agree		ure	Disag	ree	Strongly Disagree		Mean	Standard Deviation
	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%		
Acquires and evaluates information.	5	10.0	42	84.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	4.12	.31
Organizes and maintains information.	8	16.0	30	60.0	-	-	10	20.0	-	-	3.75	.98
Interprets and communicate s information.	10	20.0	18	36.0	8	16.0	12	24.0	2	4.0	3.44	1.18

* Tel.: +256754034200.

Uses	18	36.0	20	40.0	10	20.0	-	-	-	-	4.17	.75
computers to process												
information.												

294 **3.1.6.3** Interpersonal skills

The third item under this section on the questionnaire sought to find out the perception of the employers regarding interpersonal skills of TVET graduates employed in the companies or organizations of the respondents. Table 9 shows the findings.

As indicated in table 9, all the items presented to the respondents rated above the average mean on the scale running from 1 to 5. This implies that the respondents agreed that TVET graduates in Uganda possessed the interpersonal skills required for work.

301 Table 9: Interpersonal skills of TVET graduates (N=50)

Statement	Strong Agree	jly	Agree		Not Su	ire	Disag	ree	Strong Disagi		Mean	Standard Deviation
	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%		
Participates as a member of a team	7	14.0	22	44.0	10	20.0	10	20.0	-	-	3.53	.98
Teaches others new skills.	-	-	29	58.0	10	20.0	10	20.0	-	-	3.39	.81
Serves Clients/Custo mers	-	-	41	82.0	7	14.0	-	-	-	-	3.85	.36
Exercises Leadership	8	16.0	30	60.0	10	20.0	-	-	-	-	3.96	.62
Negotiates	-	-	35	70.0	8	16.0	6	12.0	-	-	3.59	.70
Works With Diversity	-	-	29	58.0	10	20.0	10	20.0	-	-	3.39	.81

302 3.1.6.4 System management skills

The fourth item under this section on the questionnaire sought to find out the perception of the employers regarding system management skills of TVET graduates. Table 10 shows the findings.

As indicated in table 10, all the items presented to the respondents rated below the average mean on the scale running from 1 to 5. This implies that the employers had a negative perception on the TVET graduates' ability to understand systems, monitor and improve systems' designs.

308 Table 10: System management skills of TVET graduates (N=50)

Statement	Strongly Agree		Agree		Not S	Not Sure		Disagree		Strongly Disagree		Standard Deviation
	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%		
Understands Systems	4	8.0	16	32.0	-	-	24	48. 0	5	10.0	2.79	1.24
Monitors and Corrects Performance	-	-	10	20.0	10	20.0	20	40. 0	10	20.0	2.40	1.03
Improves or Designs Systems.	-	-	8	16.0	8	16.0	22	44. 0	12	24.0	2.24	1.00

309

310 **3.1.6.5 Technology use.**

The fifth item under this section on the questionnaire sought to find out the perception of the employers regarding technology use by TVET graduates. Table 11 shows the findings.

From issues presented to the respondents as indicated in table 11, two items, that is, 'selects technology' (2.86), and 'Applies technology to task' (2.60) scored below the average mean value. The remaining item, 'maintains and troubleshoots equipment' (4.36) was rated above the mean average on the scale running from 1 to 5. This implies that the employers had a negative perception on the way TVET graduates select and apply technology.

Statement	Strongly Agree		Agree		Not Sure		Disagree		Strongly Disagree		Mean	Standard Deviation
	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%		
Selects Technology	3	6.0	18	36.0	-	-	25	50.0	3	6.0	2.86	1.17
Applies Technology to Task.	5	10.0	10	20.0	5	10.0	20	40.0	10	20.0	2.60	1.29
Maintains and Troubleshoot s Equipment	17	34.0	30	60.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	4.36	.49

318 Table 11: Technology use by TVET graduates (N=50)

319 **3.1.7 Cooperation with TVET institutions**

The employers were further invited to rate their cooperation with TVET institutions with regard to curriculum design of the study programmes. Table 12 shows the findings.

As indicated in table 12, out of the 50 companies or organizations from which data was gathered, the majority, 50% had never participated in curriculum design of the study programmes, whereas 40%

324 acknowledged that some times, they are involved. This implies that generally, employers do not 325 participate in curriculum design of study programmes.

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent		
Very frequently	2	4.0	4.0	4.0		
Rather frequently	3	6.0	6.0	10.0		
Sometimes	20	40.0	40.0	50.0		
Never	25	50.0	50.0	100.0		
Total	50	100.0	100.0			
	Rather frequently Sometimes Never	Very frequently2Rather frequently3Sometimes20Never25	Very frequently24.0Rather frequently36.0Sometimes2040.0Never2550.0	Very frequently 2 4.0 4.0 Rather frequently 3 6.0 6.0 Sometimes 20 40.0 40.0 Never 25 50.0 50.0		

326 Table 12: Cooperation with TVET institutions

327 3.2 Discussion

328

329 **3.2.1** Employers' rating regarding foundation skills and personal qualities required for work 330 amongst TVET graduates

Basic skills: As indicated in table 4, findings indicated that TVET graduates in Uganda possessed the basic skills required for work. According to [39], 'basic skills include both the literacy and numeracy skills necessary for getting work that can pay enough to meet day-to-day needs. These skills are also a prerequisite for continuing in education and training, and for acquiring other vocational, professional and core work skills that enhance the prospect of getting a good job'. From the experience of the researchers as TVET trainers, it's true that TVET graduates in Uganda have the basic skills required for work and to enable them pursue further studies.

338 Thinking skills: As indicated in table 5, findings indicated that employers had issues regarding decision making and reasoning of TVET graduates in Uganda. Similar challenges were reported amongst TVET 339 graduates in Malaysia. A national graduate employability blueprint 2012-2017 [40], reported that many 340 graduates were finding it difficult to get employed because they lack the technical knowledge and generic 341 skills which employers require. Among the examples of skills mentioned were teamwork skills, oral 342 communication skills, creative thinking skills and decision making skills. In the view of the researchers, 343 344 decision making and reasoning skills can be inculcated from the training methods a TVET trainer 345 employs. Further, adequately preparing young people at the lower education levels can instill those 346 values.

347 Personal qualities: As indicated in table 6, findings indicated that the employers had issues regarding self-esteem, sociability and integrity/honesty of TVET graduates in Uganda. The same concern was 348 349 raised by [41], in their study about employability awareness among Malaysian undergraduates. They noted that there was an outcry from most employers about the soft skills possessed by most graduates. 350 Most notably, employers were of the view that students lacked skills such as self-management, work 351 352 ethic, dependability, self-management and other soft skills. In the view of the researchers, TVET curriculum should also emphasize not only the technical skills but also the soft skills which are required 353 354 for graduates to fit in the world of word.

355 **5.4.2 Employers' rating regarding competences required for work amongst TVET graduates**

Resource management skills: As indicated in table 7, findings indicated that employers had issues regarding materials and facilities management by TVET graduates in Uganda. The findings are similar to

* Tel.: +256754034200.

those of [42] in their assessment of the workshop facilities management practices in technical colleges of Niger state. They concluded that there were ineffective mechanisms for proper management of workshop facilities in technical colleges and therefore the TVET programme was not meeting its intended objectives. In the view of the researcher, learners will always practice what they are taught and what they see at their training institutions. It's therefore not surprising that the employers have issues with TVET graduates regarding materials and facilities management. TVET administrators and trainers should therefore improve their facilities management practices.

Information skills: As indicated in table 8, findings indicated that employers agreed that TVET graduates in Uganda possessed the ICT skills required for work. The relevance of having adequate ICT skills was emphasized by [43] who noted that globalization and the widespread use of ICT at the workplaces in such activities like medical imaging, bio-technologies, just-in-time technology among others has affected the way work gets done in many occupations. This has led to demands of a new set of skills from prospective employees in order to make them to be successful on the job.

371 Interpersonal skills: As indicated in table 9, findings indicated that employers agreed that TVET 372 graduates in Uganda possessed the interpersonal skills required for work. This was similar to a study 373 carried out in Malaysia by [44]. The study was to identify the level of interpersonal communication skills 374 element amongst final year TVET undergraduate students in Malaysia. The findings revealed that most graduates' interpersonal communication skills had high levels of proficiency. Also, in a tracer study 375 conducted to ascertain the performance of Higher National Diploma (HND) building technology graduates 376 by [45] in Ghana, most employers emphasized that most graduates possessed attributes such as verbal 377 378 communication, teamwork, time management, commitment and interpersonal skills which are required in 379 the construction industry. This is an indicator that most TVET graduates have good interpersonal skills.

System management skills: As indicated in table 10, findings indicated that employers had issues
 regarding TVET graduates understanding of systems, monitoring and improving of systems' designs.
 This predicament was further highlighted during a private chat with a mate who has franchises in ICT and
 often employs TVET graduates in his contracts, he explained;

384 '...the type of technologies in our sector changes so rapidly. In ICT, we expect new software in the
385 market after every six months. I doubt whether the TVET institutions can cope with these rapid changes
386 to train their students to be up to-date. It is expensive for them. This implies that their graduates cannot
387 have the latest skills we require. We have to re-train them before they start to work with us'.

388 In the view of the researcher, this dilemma will be overcome with close cooperation between the training 389 institutions and the world of work.

390 Technology use: From issues presented to the respondents as indicated in table 11, findings indicated that employers in Uganda had issues regarding TVET graduates' selection and application of 391 392 technologies. Concerned about the same issue in Kenya, [46] reported in the standard media that the 393 Kenyan ministry of education is working on a program of making TVET graduates better equipped. Students studying for diplomas and certificates will spend half of the course duration on attachment. The 394 plan will ensure that graduates from middle-level colleges have the requisite skills to increase their 395 chances of securing jobs. Education experts have been faulting the current system for not giving enough 396 practical skills to diploma and certificate students before graduation. The Kenya National Qualifications 397 398 Authority (KNQA) director general Juma Mukhwana who said 'the new system would see all TVET 399 students attached to industries for mandatory internships that will be scored to form part of the overall 400 grading' [46]. In the view of the researcher, this will come a long way in enhancing students' practical 401 skills. The only fear is in implementation. For instance, how will the larger number of trainees get 402 absorbed within the few industries? And, what will be the fate of those who miss out on getting industrial 403 training placement? Therefore, a lot of answers are needed before the plan is rolled out.

404 **5.4.3 Cooperation with TVET institutions**

405 As indicated in table 12, findings indicated that most employers are left behind during curriculum design of study programmes. This is contrary to [47], who asserts that 'collaboration with industry is a means of 406 407 developing and improving the quality of training given to students in TVET institutions; a process of 408 involving the industry in the total education and training system to develop and improve student practical 409 skills and also facilitates the placement of students in industries to acquire workplace experience under an industrial attachment scheme'. Collaboration with industry leads to improvement of the quality of 410 education and training through joint curriculum development [47]. The researcher is of the view that since 411 412 industry are the end users of the TVET graduates, collaborations in curriculum design helps to incorporate those aspects employers expect to find among the graduates when they employ them. 413

414 **4. CONCLUSION**

415 It is important to identify indicators for employability skills from the employer's perspective because it is helps trainers to develop the same among the trainees. In the study, it was established that most TVET 416 417 graduates possessed the basic skills, ICT skills and interpersonal skills required for work. However, it 418 was also indicated that most employers negatively perceived some items about TVET graduates. The items were: decision making and reasoning; regarding self-esteem, sociability and integrity/honesty; 419 materials and facilities management; understanding of systems, monitoring and improving of systems' 420 421 designs; and issues regarding TVET graduates' selection and application of technologies. TVET institutions should therefore endeavor to improve on those negatively perceived aspects during the 422 423 training process to make their graduates employable.

424 **5. RECOMMENDATIONS**

- It is recommended that there should be an increase of staff exchange programmes between TVET training institutions and industry to enhance the practical skills of TVET trainers so that the gap between theory taught at the institutions and practice as demonstrated in the industry are enriched.
- There should be continuous research by TVET institutions about the essential characteristics of the labor market to analyze the main features which influence employment companies' hiring needs.
- Industrial-institutional linkages should be fostered to support curriculum improvement processes,
 provision of facilities, and provision of industrial placement opportunities for both trainees and
 trainers. This will ensure that there is no skills mismatch with training provision.
- It is further recommended that the employers, parents, and trainers in the TVET institutions should work together to nurture employability skills amongst the trainees regardless of gender or trainees' field of study.
- The TVET institutions should properly guide their trainees on the current labour market requirements and provide appropriate education which fulfils the requirements. This is possible by revising the curriculum time and again so that it is relevant and up to date.
- The duration of industrial training attachment should be increased and its effectiveness should be regularly monitored through a vibrant quality assurance system to ensure that the trainees acquire the necessary skills.

444 **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

445 We would like to extend our sincere appreciation to the African Development Bank-Higher Education, 446 Science and Technology (AfDB-HEST) project at Kyambogo University for the research funds that 447 enabled us complete the study on time.

448 **COMPETING INTERESTS**

The authors declare that there were no competing interests

450 AUTHORS' CONTRIBUTIONS

451 All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

452 ETHICAL APPROVAL

Before going to the field for data collection, the research proposal was sent to an ethical review 453 454 committee. Mbarara University of Science and Technology Research Ethical Committee (MUST-REC) 455 was used and it approved the research. Additionally, the committee approved an informed consent document which was used to get consent from the respondents before collection of the data. However, 456 457 for the study most of the employers requested to remain anonymous. The next step was to get clearance 458 from the Uganda National Council for Science and Technology (UNCST), the body which supervises 459 research activities in Uganda. The proposal was submitted to UNCST and the study was cleared to be carried out. 460

461 **REFERENCES**

- 462 [1] Mc Grawth, S. (2002). Skills for Development: a new approach to international cooperation in skills
 463 development? In Journal of Vocational Education and Training, Volume 54, Number 3, Human
 464 Sciences Research Council, Pretoria, 2002.
- 465 [2] UNESCO (2001) Technical and Vocational Education and Training for the Twenty First Century.
 466 *Revised Recommendations Concerning Technical and Vocational Education* (2001). Paris:
 467 UNESCO.
- 468 [3] Kerre, B.W. (2010). *Technology and Vocational Education and Training (TVET): A Strategy for* 469 *National Sustainable Development*. Eldoret, Kenya. Moi University Press.
- [4] Simiyu, J.W. (2009). *Revitalizing a technical training institute in Kenya; a case study of Kaiboi technical training institute, Eldoret, Kenya* downloaded on 21st Feb. 2010 from <u>www.unevoc-unesco.org</u>
- [5] UNESCO-UNEVOC (2006). Participation in Formal Technical and Vocational Education and Training
 (TVET) Worldwide: An initial statistical survey, Retrieved on February, 23 2017.
- 474 [6] Afeti, G. (2009). Technical and Vocational Education and Training for Industrialization. *Paper* 475 *presented at the African Research and Resource Forum* 2009, Nairobi Kenya. Africa: Juta
 476 & & Co. Ltd.
- [7] Oviawe, J. I., Uwameiye, R., Uddin, P. S. O. (2017). Bridging Skill Gap to Meet Technical, Vocational Education and Training School-Workplace Collaboration in the 21st Century. International Journal of Vocational Education and Training Research. Vol. 3, No. 1, 2017, pp. 7-14. doi: 10.11648/j.jiyetr.20170301.12
- 481 [8] Korean Institute, (2005). *Technical Vocational Education manual*. Korean institute of TVET 482 publication.
- 483 [9] Morris, H. (2013). Revisiting quality assurance for technical and vocational education and training in
 484 the Caribbean. Caribbean Curriculum Vol. 21, 2013, 121-148.
- 485 [10] ADEA (2008). Beyond primary education: challenges and approaches to expanding learning in
 486 Africa. Paper presented at the Biennale on education in Africa, Maputo, Mozambique.
- [11] Navaratnam, K. K., & O'Connor, R. (1993). Quality assurance in vocational education: Meeting the
 needs of the nineties. *The Vocational Aspect of Education, 45*(2), 113–
 122.doi:10.1080/0305787930450202
- [12] ILO (2010). Teachers and trainers for the future Technical and vocational education and training
 in a changing world Report for discussion at the global Dialogue, Forum on Vocational Education
 and Training (29–30 September 2010) Geneva.
- 493 [13] African Union. (2007). Strategy to *Revitalize Technical and Vocational Education and Training* 494 (*TVET*) in Africa. Addis Ababa: Conference of Ministers of Education of the African Union.
- 495 [14] McGrath, S. (2011). Where to Now for Vocational Education and Training in Africa? International Journal of Training Research, 9(2), 35-48.
- 497 [15] GoU: The Business, Technical, Vocational Education and Training Act 2008.
- 498 [16] MoES (2011). *Skilling Uganda, BTVET Strategic Plan 2011-2020.* Kampala: Ministry of Education 499 and Sports.

* Tel.: +256754034200.

- [17] Okinyal, H. (2012). *Reforming the Business, Technical Vocational Education and Training (BTVET) sub-sector: Challenges, Opportunities and Prospects*, A paper presented at the Uganda Vice
 Chancellors' Forum (UVCF), November 2012, Kampala, Uganda.
- 503 [18] World Bank, (2012). Workforce Development, Systems Approach for Better Education Results 504 (SABER) Uganda country report. <u>http://go.worldbank.org/NK2EK7MKV0.</u>
- 505 [19] MoFPED (2014) Uganda's Employment Challenge: An Evaluation of government's Strategy. Ministry 506 of Finance, Planning and Economic Development, November 2014.
- 507 [20] Okello, B. (2011). The factors influencing the negative attitude towards Technical Vocational
 508 Education and Training (TVET) in the post-colonial Uganda, PhD thesis, Kenyatta University,
 509 Nairobi Kenya.
- [21] Wood, J. C.M. (2008). The Impact of Globalization on Education Reform: A Case Study of Uganda.
 PhD thesis; University of Maryland, College Park, U.S.A
- 512 [22] Nalumansi, S.R, Mula-maige, S., Oluka, S, Rosch, G, & Moll D. (2003). Skilled manpower in 513 Uganda: A study on the BTVET Report for European Union Ministry of Education and Sports.
- [23] Uganda Bureau of Statistics (2016). Labour market transition of young people in Uganda: Highlights
 of the School-to Work Transition Survey 2015, Statistics House Plot 9, Colville Street, Kampala
- 516 [24] UNESCO. (2007). Technical education, policy framework, innovative practices and international 517 partnership. China: UNESCO.
- [25] Rasul, M., S. Rauf, R., A. & Mansor, A., N. (2013), *Employability Skills Indicator as Perceived by Manufacturing Employers,* Asian Social Science; Vol. 9, No. 8; 2013
- 520 [26] ERNWACA, (2013). National Training Authority (NTA), Tracer Study of Technical Vocational 521 Education Graduates: REPORT December, 2013
- 522 [27] MOHE (Ministry of Higher Education of Malaysia). (2009). Seminar on Employability: An Overview of 523 Graduate Employability of Recent Graduates: Some Facts and Figures. Putrajaya, Malaysia.
- 524 [28] European Commission (EC) (2010), *Employers' perception of graduate employability, Analytical* 525 *report.* Eurobarometer: November 2010. Hungary.
- 526 [29] World Bank (2010). Stepping up skills for more jobs and higher productivity. Washington, D.C.
- [30] Khandu, Y. (2014). Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET): Training providers',
 employers', instructors' and trainees' attitudes to generic/employability skills in Bhutan www.tvet online.asia Issue 3.
- [31] Munishi, E., J. (2016). Factors contributing to lack of employable skills among Technical and
 Vocational Education (TVET) graduates in Tanzania. Business Education Journal (BEJ), Volume
 I, Issue No. 2, 1-19. www.cbe.ac.tz/bej
- [32] Leke, D., K. (2010). Vocational Education and Training in Secondary Schools: An investigation into
 a Vocational Education and Training (VET) model for secondary schools in Papua New Guinea.
 PhD thesis, the University of Adelaide.
- [33] Bappah, A., S. & Medugu, J., D. (2013). *Employers' Perception of the Role of Technical Vocational Education and Training in Sustainable Development in Nigeria*. IOSR Journal of Research &
 Method in Education (IOSR-JRME) e-ISSN: 2320–7388, p-ISSN: 2320–737 X Volume 2, Issue 3
 (Jul. –Aug. 2013), PP 01-05 www.iosrjournals.org
- [34] Adjrah, Y. & Quashie, M., A. (2014). Technical and vocational education stakeholders' perceptions
 on professional skills acquired in private "Brevet de Technicien Supérieur (BTS)" schools in Togo.
 Asia-Pacific Journal of Cooperative Education, 2014, 15(4), 321-157
- [35] Ngure, S. W. (2013).Stakeholders' perceptions of technical, vocational education and training: the
 case of Kenyan micro and small enterprises in the motor vehicle service and repair industry.
 Retrieved from http://ro.ecu.edu.au/theses/597
- 546 [36] Kombo, D.K, & Tromp, D.L.A. (2006). Proposal and thesis writing. An introduction. Pauline 547 publication, Nairobi
- 548 [37] Cohen, L., & Manion, L. (1994). Research Methods in Education. London: Routledge
- 549 [38] Kean University (2013). *Empowering the Worlds researchers, Multiple Regression*. Retrieved on 20/09/2018 from <u>http://orsp.hean.edu/documents/regression%20pachet.hean</u>.

* Tel.: +256754034200.

- [39] Brewer, L., & Comyn, P. (2015), Integrating core work skills into TVET systems: six country case
 studies/ Laura Brewer, Paul Comyn; International Labour Office, Skills and Employability Branch,
 Employment Policy Department. -Geneva: ILO, 2015.
- [40] Ministry of Higher Education. (2012). *The National Higher Education Strategic Plan*. Percetakan
 Nasional Berhad, Kuala Lumpur, 2012. Doi: 10.1037/e566372006-001.
- [41] Shafie, L., & Nayan, S. (2010). Employability awareness among Malaysian undergraduates.
 International Journal of Business & Management, 5(8), 119-123.
- [42] Abdulkadir, M. & S.A. Ma'aji (2014). Assessment of the workshop facilities management practices in Technical Colleges of Niger State. International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications, Volume 4, Issue 7, July 2014 1 ISSN 2250-3153.
- [43] Bakar. A. R., Mohamed. S., & Hamzah. R. (2013). An Assessment of Workplace Skills Acquired by
 Students of Vocational and Technical Education Institutions International Education Studies; Vol.
 6, No. 11; 2013 ISSN 1913-9020 E-ISSN 1913-9039.
- [44] Jalaludin and Ihkasan (2014). Interpersonal Communication Skills among the Master's Students in TVET. Developing Country Studies ISSN 2224-607X (Paper) ISSN 2225-0565 (Online) Vol.4, No.16, 2014.
- [45] Awere, E., Edu-Buandoh, K. B. M., Dadzie, D.K. and Aboagye, J. A (2014). *Performance of Higher National Diploma of Building Technology Graduates in the Construction Industry:* A Tracer Study
 in Kumasi Metropolis, Ghana In: Nkum R.K., Nani G., Atepor, L., Oppong, R.A., Awere E., And
 Bamfo-Agyei, E. (Eds) Procs 3rd Applied Research Conference In Africa. (ARCA) Conference, 79 August 2014, Accra, Ghana. 319-327.
- 572 [46] Oduor, A. (2018). *New plan to eliminate 'half-baked' graduates*. Standard media, September 26th, 2018.
- 574 [47] Arfo, E., B. (2015). A Comparative Analysis of Technical and Vocational Education and Training 575 Policy in Selected African Countries. PhD thesis, University of KwaZulu-Natal Durban.
- 576