

Editor's comment:

The work has methodology errors. Please check the attached. It requires review.

Author's feedback:

Response to Revised-ms_IJPSS_44187_v1

The suggestions in the document 'Revised-ms_IJPSS_44187_v1' have been considered and the title has been modified considerably to reduce the number of words. The authority of the scientific names have also been included as suggested.

The suggested title was **Insect pests of leaf amaranth (*Amaranthus hybridus* L and control using oil extracts of *Alium sativum* L, *Xylopia aethiopica* Dunal and *Eucalyptus globulus* L'.**

We are not interested in controlling insect populations per say, we are rather interested in prevention of herbivory and damage to the leaf amaranth, which is the title of the paper and it is reflected in our materials and method, results and discussion. By this, the title is very appropriate as 'Insect pest profile of leaf amaranth (*Amaranthus hybridus* L) and prevention of herbivory using oil-based extracts of *Alium sativum* L, *Xylopia aethiopica* Dunal and *Eucalyptus globulus* L'

In line 15-16, where we reported the percentage of insect Orders and the total was 101% instead of 100%, changes have been made. The error in the addition emanated from 62.5% and 12.5% which were approximated into whole numbers, 63% and 13 % respectively. This has been corrected and looks good now.

The reviewer seriously confused extraction of oil from plants with preparation of vegetable oil-based extract (similar to preparation of water hot water-extract) from botanicals, and **that was his concern about the methodology**. We have now modified the title to reflect this and changes have also been made in the text. We applied widely reported method of preparing crude extracts, such as hot water-extract from plants but, with slight modifications. Water was replaced with vegetable oil (because of hydrophobic volatiles in the botanicals). The method of heating was also changed from water bath heating method to microwave heat. The procedure is simple, novel, clearly

described and repeatable. Thus, our method of preparation of the vegetable oil based-extract is appropriate.

Our interest was to report a simple method of preparing vegetable oil based-extract from botanicals that contain volatile components, a procedure which can be easily adopted by poor-resource farmers. The results obtained from the treated plants (significantly low damage relative to control), showed that the method is effective.

(Line 158) on the order of our methodology that '**assessment of pest profile and nature of damage**' should come after '**application of extracts and assessment of damage**'. The two assessments are independent and the pest profile in the field had to be recorded before applying treatments that are capable of repelling insects. **The sequence of our methodology is therefore very appropriate.** We have corrected typographical mistakes and effected other minor corrections.