



**SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1**

**PART 1:**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Journal of Applied Life Sciences International</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JALSI_41470
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of Locally Formulated Watermelon and Moringa Syrup Booster on the Growth Performance of Heterobranchus bidorsalis Fingerlings
Type of Article:	Original Research Article

**PART 2:**

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
<p><b>General comment</b></p> <p>The authors have only partially made the suggested corrections. They didn't replay to my comments in the 3.Feedback_JALSI_41470_v1_Ric file giving specific answers and indicating the number of the line in the new manuscript. The new manuscript has been little improved. Authors have only deleted without adding any useful information. In general there is a scarce and superficial attention to the changes made in the text. A greater effort should have been made to improve the revision of the formatting throughout the MS, the tables and the legends, including punctuation, parenthesis, spaces between numbers and unit of measure, different size of the font, language, a better description of the results.</p> <p><b>Specific Comment</b></p> <p><b>Abstract</b> Why the <i>Study design</i> is completely changed in the new version?</p> <p><b>Introduction</b> Lines 23-24: the statement "the fluctuating level of ingredients contained in commercial feed becomes a barrier" is questionable, because formulated commercial feed generally guarantee constant levels of the ingredients, while their cost can oscillate. Please, give a reference to support this statement. <b>request not totally accomplished, please clarify in the text of the manuscript what is reported in the reference 6 about the reasons of the fluctuating level of ingredients in commercial feed</b></p> <p>Line 27-31: please, give a reference about the properties of boosters <b>Reference 13 is on properties of Polyphenols that probably are also present in the Moringa and Watermelon, but are not reported in the text, while Carotenoids are present, so the reference 13 is not properly correct.</b></p> <p>Line 35: Watermelon and Moringa syrup booster <b>used</b> are categorized under phytogenics <b>Accomplished</b></p> <p>Lines 37: virus, oxidation etc. <b>They</b> aid in digestion as such <b>Accomplished</b></p> <p>Line 40: please, specify the geographic context in which the local farmers operate</p>	<p>The study design was rephrased because the first study design was not recognised, so i decided to rewrite it.</p> <p>I have given a reference to support my statement under introduction, kindly check line 26.</p> <p>I have references to support my statement under growth booster, kindly check lines 35 and 39.</p> <p>Reference 13 which is now 14 has been corrected and another Reference has been added to support carotenoids, line 31.</p>



**SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1**

(Nigeria?)  
**Accomplished**

Line 41: ..... there is a need **the opportunity** to incorporate the product into preparation of high energy level fish....  
**Partially accomplished: the article "THE" is lacking**

Line 43: ..... *Heterobranchus bidorsalis*, which belongs to the Clariidea family, can **de well be reared** on formulated and less expensive feed.  
**Accomplished**

*Line 41-48 old manuscript.* The language must be carefully revised in in this paragraph, and  
*Line 41-43:* The type of feed regimen normally used to breed *H. bidorsalis* should be described as well as the reasons why the feed quality varies over time. Please, support the statement with data or references.  
**Sentence 41-43 deleted but the language in the remaining paragraph is not revised (45-51 new version)**

*Line 46-47 old manuscript:* Does it mean that those plant products are already utilized in aquaculture in Nigeria ? Please, specify.  
**Not accomplished, this information is important to better characterize the current state of the catfish farming in Nigeria**

*Line 49-51 old manuscript:* the meaning of the sentence is not entirely clear: please specify if plant booster are already used, and in which geographic context ("locally" means Nigeria?)  
**"Considering the plant species used for the locally formulated booster," deleted, but now all the paragraph is disconnected from the rest of the text and It loses its meaning. This paragraph (lines 51-66) should be inserted and merged with the lines 27-31.**

**Materials and Methods**

Line 74-75: please, provide more features related to the *commercial feed from the Skretting* (for example, if the product is available on a web site), and to the *commercial booster (leegrow)*, linking it to table 1.  
**Line 74: write as follow: Commercial feed of different size 1 mm, 2.5 mm and 3.2 mm (Company: Skretting, proximate composition at Table 4, that should became Table 1 and all the others tables should be changed consequently). In Table 4, Skretting is written as skerettin, please change and modify also variables in sizes.**

**Line 75: write "oleifera" all in italic**

Line 122-123: as reported in the abstract insert: *after coating 2ml/1kg<sup>1</sup> of the commercial feed with their individual growth booster syrup*  
**Please delete: "as reported in the abstract"**

Line 125: space between: **liter). Weekly**

Corrected

Reference has been added

Moring and Watermelon has been used in other Animal feed production, also Dada and Olugbemi, ( 2013) produced feed additives for catfish using other plant products but this research is the first to the best of my knowledge on the utilization of watermelon (*Citrullus lanatus*) and *Moringa oleifera* as



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

<p><b>Accomplished</b></p> <p>Line 131-133: please, specify which are the “some nutrient utilization variables” If they are <i>protein efficiency ratio (PER)</i> and <i>feed conversion efficiency (FCE)</i>, describe how they were evaluated. <b>Sentence deleted</b></p> <p>Line 138-139 old manuscript: “ <i>The recorded values of Temperature was at 27-28.9 °C while pH was within the range of 6.0-6.5</i>”, this sentence is already reported in the results section and should not be into the materials and methods section. <b>Accomplished</b></p> <p><b>Results and Discussion</b></p> <p>Lines 173-174: the number of samples on which this analysis was performed for each type of booster is not clear. Please, clarify. <b>Request not accomplished: please give in the text (M&amp;M) or in the Table 1 the number of samples used to calculate means and S.D.</b></p> <p><b>Line 176: Why “Ash” is in capital letter?</b></p> <p>Lines 197-198: “<i>Temperature and pH values were measured daily using glass thermometer and pH kit and other physico-chemical parameters were obtained using Extech instrument (Do 700) from Institute of Pollution Studies (IPS) RSU and the values obtained were recorded.</i>” please, delete these two sentences, which are repetitions of MM <b>Accomplished</b></p> <p>Table 2: please, give the mean and standard deviations or the range for all the parameters measured, specially if they are collected every day, and consequently change <i>Compositions</i> with <i>Values Range</i> or <i>Values Mean</i> <b>Not accomplished</b></p> <p>Lines 227-229 old manuscript: It is not necessary repeat again: “<i>Commercial feed coated with commercial syrup booster (CbCf), commercial feed (Cf), commercial feed coated with watermelon syrup booster (WbCf) and commercial feed coated with Moringa syrup booster (MbCf).</i>” <b>Accomplished</b></p> <p>Line 230 old manuscript: ...<i>and WbCf which.....it</i> is not correct: change with MbCf <b>Accomplished</b></p> <p>Line 258: <i>growth rate performance(Fig.5)</i> also, please space between <i>performance</i> and (Fig.5)</p> <p>Line 315, now line 285: <i>growth rate(Fig.7)</i> against, please space between <i>rate</i> and (Fig.7) <b>Accomplished</b></p>	<p><i>Heterobranchus bidorsalis</i> fingerlings growth booster syrup.</p> <p>Leegrow is a commercial syrup booster and skretting is also a commercial pelleted fish feed. Both acted as the control against the newly formulated watermelon and moringa syrup booster</p> <p>Corrected. I also corrected an error made. Commercial feed used was 1mm, 1.8mm and 2.5mm not the other way round.</p> <p>Corrected</p> <p>Corrected</p>
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------



**SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1**

Lines 346-350 old manuscript, now 206-310: please rephrase because the comment is not clear, and show the data of PER FCE.

**Description of the results in the Table 3 are not sufficient and It continue to not be clear**

Lines 325: please put a space "recordedno"

**Accomplished**

Lines 335: please, provide the carbohydrates data of *Moringa oleifera* and watermelon in %, as above

**Not Accomplished**

Line 378: Style of Bibliography is not the same as in the Introduction

**Accomplished**

Line 384: Style of Bibliography is not the same as in the Introduction

**Accomplished**

**Conclusion**

Lines 396-398: "As such, fish farmers should look inward on the utilization of watermelon growth syrup booster for effective growth performance of catfish".

It should be underlined that the watermelon syrup booster could be used by fish farmers not only for the encouraging growth performance data, but also for the more accessible cost and within a policy of green circular economy that aims at food waste recover.

**Not Accomplished**

Only value mean was analysed, no standard deviation



**SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1**

	<p>Corrected, line 287</p> <p>Couldn't find where this is but the carbohydrate content of moringa and watermelon (%) is indicated in line 361, also it can be found in table 2</p>
--	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------