



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Journal of Experimental Agriculture International</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_48972
Title of the Manuscript:	Genetic Diversity and Responses of Some Selected Yellow Maize Genotypes to Stem Borer ( <i>Sesamia calamistis</i> Hampson) infestation
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<p><b>Some editing needed</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The introduction says the borers lower yield, but the data do support that; there needs to be a rational explanation provided.</li> <li>2. This does not make sense!! If many plants died, yield would be affected. It suggests that tolerance is more important than selecting for true resistance Remember your claims in lines 47-50 showing yield losses attributed to borers!</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Yes, it could be observed that the result shows that most of the parents evaluated had low grain yield of around 1t/ha while most of the hybrids had grain yield of above 2t/ha. This phenomenon shows that <b>Heterosis</b> has taken place, whereby the performances of the hybrid were better than their corresponding parents in terms of yield, tolerance to diseases etc, therefore the hybrids tolerated the stem borer infestation better than the parents as a result of the favourable alleles that has been transmitted from the stem borer resistant parent (BR9928 DMR SR-Y) to the progenies/hybrids.</li> <li>2. The assertion of the reviewer is not applicable to this study because the highest number of dead heart per plot was around 3 plants and the association was not even significant with grain yield therefore the statement of the reviewer cannot be generalized.</li> </ol>
<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments	See attached track changes	The manuscript has been revised accordingly, thank you.
<b>Optional/General</b> comments		

**PART 2:**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)	