



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Journal of Experimental Agriculture International</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_49851
Title of the Manuscript:	Plants mineral nutrition on the preference of <i>Glycaspis brimblecombei</i> (Hemiptera: Aphalaridae) in <i>Eucalyptus</i> sp.
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p>	<p><b>ABSTRACT</b></p> <p>Specify the measured variables and statistical analysis applied. To publicize the outstanding results in terms of numbers.</p> <p>Add the following words to the Keywords: natural defense, plant nutrition, economic importance.</p> <p><b>INTRODUCTION</b></p> <p>Provide the information on the economic aspect and the damage that causes the red gum lerp psyllid to Eucalyptus plantations. Also highlight the economic importance of forest under the plantation of Eucalyptus species in terms of wood production in Brazil.</p> <p>Change "readily accessible for the insects nutrition" to "readily accessible for the insect's nutrition".</p> <p><b>MATERIAL AND METHODS</b></p> <p>Change "under the Coordinates 15°57'07"S and 54°32'42" and altitude 504 m. The experimental area soil is classified as a dystrophic Yellow Latosol of sandy texture, according to <b>Embrapa</b>, [10]" to "under the <b>geographical</b> coordinates 15°57'07"S <b>latitude</b> and 54°32'42"<b>E longitude with an</b> altitude of 504 m.a.l.s. The experimental area soil is classified as a dystrophic Yellow Latosol of sandy texture, according to <b>Embrapa</b>, [10].</p> <p>The results on the chemical Characteristics (MO, phosphorus (P), potassium (K), Aluminum, calcium (Ca), magnesium (etc) should be presented in the section of results and discussions.</p> <p>CHANGE: "RESULTS E DISCUSSION" to "RESULTS AND DISCUSSION"</p> <p><b>RESULTS AND DISCUSSION</b></p> <p>The results of table 1 on "totals values of screening of <i>Glycaspis brimblecombei</i>" in function of Eucalyptus species lack the statistical support. The results lack the application of ANOVA, this in order to verify whether there are significant differences among the seven treatments for the variables eggs &amp; lerps depending on species of Eucalyptus.</p> <p>Results on "values of screening totals of <i>Glycaspis brimblecombei</i>" were not sufficiently discussed and also compared with the results of other authors.</p> <p>Under a factorial experimental design in complete blocks, the results of Table 2 do not present if there were interactions between factors (species and treatments depending on number of eggs &amp; lerps).</p> <p>The graphs on Population fluctuation of eggs (a, c, e) and lerps (b, d, f) of <i>Glycaspis</i></p>	<p><b>ABSTRACT</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ok</li> <li>- The suggested keywords were included in the paper.</li> </ul> <p><b>INTRODUCTION</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Damage to eucalyptus plantations was provided in the paper, but research on the economic impact of the attack is not found in the specific literature. As suggested the economic importance of the forest was inserted into the paper.</li> <li>- Really, it was a typo.</li> </ul> <p><b>MATERIAL AND METHODS</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Suggestions accepted.</li> <li>- Suggestions accepted.</li> <li>- Really, it was a typo.</li> </ul> <p><b>RESULTS AND DISCUSSION</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- With the addition of the soil analysis table, the numbering was changed, table 1 is now table 2 - The results of Table 2 are really about "total <i>Glycaspis brimblecombei</i> sorting values" as a function of <i>Eucalyptus</i> species, and, for this reason, were not analyzed statistically. This table was added as a complement to table 3, in order to make it less complex.</li> <li>- As a multidisciplinary study, the authors had difficulties in finding papers that would help them in describing the results and especially in the discussion of this paper.</li> <li>- The comparison of the data with statistics was demonstrated in table 3, whose factorial experiment showed interaction between the factors <math>p</math> value = 0.0062 for eggs and <math>p</math> value = 0.0007 for lerps.</li> <li>- Suggestions accepted.</li> </ul>



SDI Review Form 1.6

	<p><i>brimblecombei</i> lack statistical information (standard deviation).</p> <p>The results on a) The weather variations &amp; their interference in the insects biology, b) The nutritional imbalance in N/K ratio, c) The infestation of experimental planting, d) The time of occurrence of this pest, were interpreted, reporting numerous other authors of similar work. However, the results do not compare properly nor discuss the results of other authors. The text merely refers only to other authors as a bibliographic record.</p>	<p>- As previously mentioned, we authors had difficulties in discussing the data collected, because the literature is still scarce on the mechanisms of plant resistance to insect attack, which does not occur in studies of resistance of plants to pathogens.</p>
<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments	<p><b>REFERENCES:</b> Correct references, rename uppercase and lowercase.</p> <p><b>Add the name of the authors of the following phrases:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• because according to <b>Epstein</b>, [14],</li> <li>• According to <b>Tuller et al.</b>, [19] the occurrence of red gum lerp psyllid,</li> <li>• According to <b>Frmino-Winckler, et al.</b>, [4], the growth of the population of <i>G. brimblecombei</i></li> <li>• <b>Silva et al.</b>, [20] also found the highest population density</li> <li>• The region interferes in the pest infestation period, <b>Montes y Raga</b>, [21] studied</li> <li>• Taylor (Hemiptera: Aphalaridae), <b>Soufo &amp; Tamesse</b>, [22] observed,</li> <li>• According to <b>Oliveira et al.</b>, [23] the rain as a control agent,</li> <li>• temperature. According to <b>Firmino-Winckler</b>, [4], the temperature of 26°C is the most suitable,</li> <li>• a result obtained by <b>Silva et al.</b>, [20] who described the increase,</li> <li>• <b>Soufo, Tamesse</b>, [22] also observed the influence of temperature on the number of individuals,</li> <li>• <b>Sooker et al.</b>, [24] confirmed the relationship between the reduction of populations,</li> </ul>	<p>- Ok</p> <p>- Suggestions accepted, changes made.</p>
<b>Optional/General</b> comments		

**PART 2:**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)	