



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Environment & Ecology
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEE_50158
Title of the Manuscript:	CONSERVATION EDUCATION, ALTERNATIVE LIVELIHOOD AND HABITAT RESTORATION: THE BEST STRATEGIES FOR CONSERVATION OF MAGOMBERA FOREST RESERVE
Type of Article:	

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
<p>In simple terms - see my comments. Conservation is thrown around, but other than tree planting; only on-the-farm bee keeping is discussed.</p> <p>The paper fails to discuss how the traditional natural resource users from the community (e.g., sawyers, hunters, fishers, charcoal makers, medicine collectors, thatch grass collectors, etc. will be integrated into the management of the forest. It sounds like the author's only see the forest as "real values of conservation (i.e., water, soil and environmental buffering)" but as the local community says - "not in my backyard" response, not "at the expense of my livelihood". It leaves one with the feeling that this is another off-limits area that will alienate the local community and turn them into poachers. It feels like another Western Donor funded Integrated Rural Development Project. If it is not then the author (s) must go into great lengths to discuss more than is in the current paper. There are also major grammatical errors I have tried to address.</p> <p>There are Yellow marked areas that were already there and have nothing to do with my editing.</p>	<p>-Yes there are many livelihoods issues in the area, but this is paper on the report done on some of them that is trees planting, beekeeping and conservation education.</p> <p>As said there are various challenges on the livelihood issues, this work was on the beekeeping that can be a source of household income and whoever is engaged in sawing, hunting, fishing, charcoal making, medicine collection and thatch grass collecting can do beekeeping which is friendly to the environment and can generate household income. Moreover the conservation education expand the view on importance of conserving the forest to benefit other important activities such as agriculture. There are other project in the area trying to get alternatives resources and sources of resources for communities' example poultry keeping which make them independent of forest resources or at least sustainable use of the resources . But these are out of the scope for this paper which focuses on three things that are tree planting, conservation education and beekeeping. This still contribute and address on inclusive plans for communities to enable sustainable conservation of the forest. Grammatical errors have been looked at.</p>

Comment [A1]: Of course – if you are attempting to cut these traditional natural resource users from accessing the forest and its diversity of resources- you will alienate them towards conservation and clandestine harvests (poaching) of natural resources will make sustainable management impossible. Driven by poverty and desperation, they will mine the natural resources for short-term gain without the luxury to look to the future and the adverse impacts this might have for their children and grandchildren. I hope you get this and if this paper does not bring out and highlight such issues, it should not be published.