



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Environment & Ecology
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEE_50158
Title of the Manuscript:	CONSERVATION EDUCATION, ALTERNATIVE LIVELIHOOD AND HABITAT RESTORATION: BEST STRATEGIES FOR CONSERVATION OF MAGOMBERA FOREST RESERVE
Type of Article:	

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
<p>In simple terms - see my comments. Conservation is thrown around, but other than tree planting, only on-the-farm bee keeping is discussed. The paper fails to discuss how the traditional natural resource users from the community (e.g., sawyers, hunters, fishers, charcoal makers, medicine collectors, thatch grass collectors, etc. will be integrated into the management of the forest. It sounds like the author's only see the forest as "real values of conservation (i.e., water, soil and environmental buffering)" but as the local community says - "not in my backyard" response, not "at the expense of my livelihood". It leaves one with the feeling that this is another off-limits area that will alienate the local community and turn them into poachers. It feels like another Western Donor funded Integrated Rural Development Project. If it is not then the author (s) must go into great lengths to discuss more than is in the current paper. There are also major grammatical errors I have tried to address. There are Yellow marked areas that were already there and have nothing to do with my editing.</p>	

Comment [A1]: Of course – if you are attempting to cut these traditional natural resource users from accessing the forest and its diversity of resources- you will alienate them towards conservation and clandestine harvests (poaching) of natural resources will make sustainable management impossible. Driven by poverty and desperation, they will mine the natural resources for short-term gain without the luxury to look to the future and the adverse impacts this might have for their children and grandchildren. I hope you get this and if this paper does not bring out and highlight such issues, it should not be published.

Reviewer Details:

Name:	<i>Paul Andre Degeorges</i>
Department, University & Country	<i>Tshwane University of Technology, South Africa</i>