

Original Research Article

DETERMINATION OF SELECTED HEAVY METALS IN TOBACCO TREE SHRUBS GROWING AROUND DANDORA DUMPSITE, NAIROBI, KENYA

ABSTRACT

Environmental pollution by heavy metals is presently a serious threat to public health. Despite the toxic contaminants contained in municipal waste, most of the dumpsites remain unregulated and uncontrolled. The objective of this study was to determine the levels of Pb, Cr and Cd in the leaves of tobacco tree plants growing around the dumpsite so as to assess their impact on the environment. The total concentration of the metals in the soil was done so as to calculate the transfer factors. pH and total organic carbon (TOC) of the soil was also determined. Soil and plant samples were collected thrice from sixteen sampling sites along the off-loading path from the centre of Dandora dumpsite up to a distance of 700 m away from the centre at depth of 0-30cm (top soil). Metal analysis was done using flame atomic absorption spectroscopy (FAAS). Pb levels ranged from 7.58 ± 0.34 to 16.57 ± 0.79 $\mu\text{g/g}$ in the washed leaves and 9.22 ± 0.36 to 19.27 ± 0.40 $\mu\text{g/g}$ in the unwashed leaves. Cr levels ranged from 5.11 ± 0.40 to 14.4 ± 0.91 $\mu\text{g/g}$ in the washed leaves and 5.01 ± 0.45 to 15.50 ± 0.40 $\mu\text{g/g}$ in the unwashed leaves. While Cd levels ranged from 0.24 ± 0.01 to 3.62 ± 0.17 $\mu\text{g/g}$ in the washed leaves and 0.37 ± 0.02 to 3.68 ± 0.25 $\mu\text{g/g}$ in the unwashed leaves. All these levels were above World Health Organization recommended limits in plants of Pb ($0.3 \mu\text{g/g}$), Cr ($3 \mu\text{g/g}$) and Cd ($0.2 \mu\text{g/g}$). Pearson correlation of the levels in the plants with their concentrations in the soils gave significantly positive values. This suggest that high metal concentration in the soil leads to increased mobility and hence bioavailability. Results obtained therefore suggests that Dandora dumpsite is highly polluted and people should be discouraged from using waste from the dumpsite as manure.

Key words: Heavy Metals, Tobacco Trees, Dumpsite, Mobility, Bio-availability.

1. INTRODUCTION

Historically dumpsites have been the oldest and most common forms of waste disposal and remain so in many places around the world. Most of the waste that find its way in dumpsites in most industrial areas includes agricultural wastes, hazardous wastes and wastes from motor garages which contains heavy metals (F.B.G. Tanee and T.N.Eshalomi-Mario, 2015). Heavy metals take part in biogeochemical cycles and are not permanently fixed in the soil. Therefore, assessment of their distribution in the soil is a key issue in many environmental studies because these heavy metals can find their way in to the food chain causing toxic health effects. The soil acts as a long term sink for heavy metals which have residence times varying from hundreds to thousands of years depending on the element and soil properties (Iyakwari et al., 2016).

When in the soil these heavy metals circulate by both natural and anthropogenic processes to reach air and plants. Plants accumulate these heavy metals from soils and partly from water and air which later move to animals and especially to man causing adverse health effects (G.Kimani, 2007). One of the sources of heavy metal pollution is from industrial effluent dumped into open sites. Dandora dumpsite attracts special attention in that it is one of Africa's largest dumpsite serving over four million Nairobi residents. Dumping is unrestricted and uncontrolled. Industrial, agricultural and domestic wastes are strewn all over the dumpsite. Nairobi River passes by the dumpsite and heavy metals find their way into the river. Communities living near the dumpsite use contaminated water for irrigation of food crops and in their homes. Waste from the dumpsite is also used as manure by the nearby farmers.

Animals such as pigs, cows and goats feed on plants growing around the dumpsite which leads to the entry of heavy metals into the food chain. Families living near the dumpsite use the site to look for recyclables which they sell for some income. This leads to contact with contaminated soils. A research done by UNEP found most children who were admitted to the nearby hospitals had lead levels exceeding

Comment [i1]: Missed space

Comment [i2]: Missed space

Comment [i3]: Missed space

Comment [i4]: Missed space

Comment [i5]: Missed space

Comment [i6]: Missed space

Comment [i7]: suggest

Comment [i8]: Bioavailability (as in line 23)

Comment [i9]: This statement should be supported by the relevant references.

Comment [i10]: This part of the text should be incorporated in lines 32-33.

Comment [i11]: This sentence should be incorporate earlier in lines 29-31.

Comment [i12]: Is this United Nations Environment Program? The full name is required followed by abbreviation where it first appear. Only abbreviation can be then used further through the manuscript.

51 WHO limits (G.Kimani, 2007). The pollutants in these wastes include heavy metals such as lead,
52 cadmium and chromium.

Comment [i13]: World Health Organization (WHO)

53 2. Materials and Methods

54 2.1 Area of study

Comment [i14]: Missing space

55 Dandora dumpsite is located in Nairobi Eastland's 8 km from Nairobi central district. It GPS coordinates
56 are 1.2483° S, 36.8963° E. It occupies an area of 30 acres and serves around 4.5 million Nairobi
57 residents since it is the only official dumping location in Nairobi. The main economic activities of the
58 people surrounding the dumpsite arise from the surrounding industries. It receives about 2000 tonnes of
59 waste every day and it is home for many poor individuals who have spent their entire life in the dumpsite
60 (Olayiwola & Azeez, 2017).

61 2.2 Sampling and Sample Pre-treatment

62 Sampling was done thrice during the dry months of August, September and October 2014. Soil samples
63 were collected in a stratified way around the dumpsite from a radius of 100 M. to 1 KM. at intervals of 100
64 M. Soil samples were collected at depths of 0-30cm. A total of 32 soil and tobacco tree plants (*Nicotiana
65 glauca Graham*) samples were collected per sampling period. Plant samples were collected at equidistant
66 points to the soil samples. All the samples were taken to Kenyatta university laboratory for analysis. All
67 soil samples were ground and passed through a 0.1 mm sieve. They were further dried in an oven at
68 150°C for 24 hrs. 1 g of the dried ground sample was placed in a conical flask. To the flask 5 ml of
69 analytical grade mixture of concentrated nitric acid and perchloric acid in the ratio 3:1 were added and the
70 flask placed on a hot digestion block. 10 ml of 0.5 M HCl was added and heated to boiling to recover the
71 metals. The mixture was filtered and diluted to 50 ml in a volumetric flask (Mulamu, 2014). Likewise a
72 blank was also prepared. Soil sample from each horizon in the dumpsite were used to separate metals
73 into four operationally defined fractions through sequential extraction (Esakku et al., 2015).

Comment [i15]: ,

Comment [i16]: m

Comment [i17]: km

Comment [i18]: m

Comment [i19]: °c

Comment [i20]: Hours or h

Comment [i21]: soil

74 2.3 Preparation of Plant Samples for AAS Analysis

75 Plant samples were washed with tap water to remove adhering soil particles and then rinsed with distilled
76 water. Some plant samples were not washed but kept in dust proof polythene bags for analysis of the
77 unwashed leaves. The samples were then cut into small pieces, air-dried for 2 days and finally dried at
78 100°C in hot air oven for 3 hours (Olanrewaju, 2019). The samples were then ground and passed through
79 a 1mm sieve. Digestion involved measuring 1g of the ground sample and placing it in a clean flask. To
80 the flask 5ml of analytical grade mixture of concentrated nitric acid, Sulphuric acid and perchloric acid in
81 the ratio 3:1:1 were added and the flask placed on a hot digestion block. 10 ml of 0.5M HCl was added
82 and heated to boiling to recover the metals. The mixture was filtered and diluted to 50ml in a volumetric
83 flask (Mulamu, 2014). A blank comprising of the reagents in the proportions as for the samples but
84 containing no sample material was prepared likewise.

Comment [i22]: Hours or h

86 2.4 Determination of Soil pH and Total Organic Carbon

87 The procedure proposed by (Abdus, 2009) was used in determination of pH and total organic carbon
88 (TOC) Soil sample (8 g) was mixed with 20 mL distilled water. The mixture was stirred using a glass rod
89 then allowed to stand for 30 minutes with occasional stirring every 10 minutes. After 30 minutes, a pH
90 probe model (Heinrich T205) was placed at a depth of about 3 cm inside the suspension. Readings were
91 taken after about 30 seconds. The pH meter and probe had previously been calibrated using de-ionized
92 water, pH 7.0 and pH 4.0 buffer solutions. For TOC, the method uses wet oxidation technique which
93 utilizes exothermic heating and oxidation of organic carbon in the sample. 0.3 g soil sample was placed in
94 a clean, dry digestion tube and potassium dichromate (5 mL) was added followed by concentrated
95 Sulphuric acid (5 mL). The contents were mixed by swirling. The solution of potassium dichromate was
96 prepared by dissolving 49.024 g of dry salt in about 600 mL distilled water and bringing the volume to
97 1000 mL with distilled water. The digestion tube with its contents were placed in a digestion block which

Comment [i23]: Where is this reference in reference list?

Comment [i24]: This procedure should be supported by relevant reference.

98 had been preheated to about 150°C for 30 minutes. Contents of the tube were transferred into a 200 mL
 99 Erlenmeyer flask followed by addition 0.3 mL of indicator. This solution was titrated against 0.2 mol L⁻¹
 100 ferrous ammonium sulphate solution. The endpoint of the titration was determined by a change in colour
 101 of the indicator diphenylamine.

Comment [i25]: Authors should name indicator here.

Comment [i26]: Extra space

102 3. Results and Discussion

103 3.1 Total Metal Content in the Dumpsite Soils

104 Mean and standard deviation of Pb, Cr and Cd concentrations are presented in table 1. For the three
 105 metals, concentrations increased to a maximum in the soil collected from the centre of the dumpsite and
 106 decreased away from the center.

Comment [i27]: Extra space

Comment [i28]: This sentence is very similar with that in lines 110-111. They should be combined into one to avoid repeating.

107
 108 **Table 1. Levels of Pb, Cr and Cd in the Dumpsite Soils (µg/g)**

Metals	Lead	Chromium	Cadmium
Site	0-30cm	0-30cm	0-30cm
1	1087.11±25.64	183.07±14.11	45.52±4.57
2	983.69±50.94	170.52±14.28	30.67±2.68
3	807.59±59.24	139.13±11.49	19.24±3.24
4	318.64±67.02	119.23±9.80	21.74±1.50
5	226.43±20.12	91.36±5.34	23.37±2.21
6	105.04±12.19	69.43±5.46	19.16±1.35
7	71.47±5.14	47.77±2.16	11.84±1.08
8	41.21±4.03	39.16±2.24	10.27±0.44

Comment [i29]: Authors should consider to add one more column in which the exact distances from the dumpsite center will be showed. It will be more clear than in the text. It is only visible than distance at 8 site is 700 m, but what are the distances from the dumpsite center of other sites?

Comment [i30]: It is not necessary in table since there is only one depth as well as it is already mentioned earlier in the text.

109 From table 1 above, metal concentration decreased as the distance from the centre of the dumpsite
 110 increased. In all the sites there was a significant difference in levels of the heavy metals with distance. In
 111 the upper soil profile the Pb levels in the soils were the highest followed by Cr and the least was Cd. Pb
 112 levels in the soils ranged from a mean of 41.21±4.03µg/g in site 8 which is 700m from the centre of the
 113 dumpsite to a maximum of 1087.11±25.64 µg/g in site 1 which is at the centre of the dumpsite. The levels
 114 of total chromium ranged from 39.16±2.24 µg/g to 183.07±14.11 µg/g over the same range. Cd levels
 115 ranged from 10.27±0.44 µg/g to 45.52±4.27 µg/g. These results generally agreed well with ranges of Pb
 116 in a Nigerian dumpsite soils report (G.O.Adewuyi et al., 2010) who reported levels ranging from 1300µg/g
 117 to 1693 µg/g. However (Awokunmi, Asaolu, & Ipinmoroti, 2010) found higher levels of lead in dumpsite
 118 soil of Nigeria ranging from 3500 µg/g to 6860 µg/g. These high levels of lead in the soil could be
 119 attributed to the dumping of used car batteries, used oils dumped from surrounding car garages, expired
 120 paints and exhaust fumes from the many lorries which off-load various wastes in the dumpsite. The high
 121 levels of Cr could be attributed to dumping of waste from chromate processing industries and peelings
 122 from car paints and primers. Wastes from paint industries and asbestos lining erosion could also increase
 123 levels of chromium in the soils. Among the three metals under study cadmium had the lowest total
 124 concentration. Compared to most soil standards the dumpsite is highly contaminated with cadmium. This
 125 could be attributed to dumping of cadmium batteries used in phones, waste from paint industries and
 126 metal refining (Katana Chengo, 2013).

Comment [i31]: Where is this reference in reference list?

127 128 3.2 Levels of Pb, Cr and Cd in the Leaves of *Nicotiana glauca graham* (µg/g)

Comment [i32]: Unnecessary dot

130 Determination of heavy metal concentrations in plants was done using flame atomic absorption
 131 spectroscopy (FAAS). The mean levels of Pb, Cr and Cd in tobacco tree shrubs growing equidistant to
 132 where the soil samples were taken were determined for the washed leaves and unwashed leaves.
 133 Results of levels of the three metals in the washed and unwashed leaves are presented in table 2

134 **Table 2. Levels of Pb, Cr and Cd in the Leaves of *Nicotiana glauca graham* (µg/g)**

Comment [i33]: Unnecessary dot

Site	Washed leaves			Unwashed leaves		
	Pb	Cr	Cd	Pb	Cr	Cd
1	16.57±0.79	14.40±0.91	3.62±0.17	19.27±0.40	15.50±0.40	3.68±0.25
2	14.29±0.85	12.55±0.57	2.34±0.13	16.15±0.04	15.21±0.40	2.82±0.10
3	13.22±0.49	9.95±0.73	2.05±0.09	13.86±2.01	12.40±0.14	2.10±0.03
4	11.76±0.44	8.91±0.38	1.76±0.05	14.43±0.13	9.34±0.48	1.14±0.31
5	9.54±0.56	7.90±0.71	1.31±0.29	11.07±0.46	5.75±0.23	1.46±0.29
6	9.42±0.62	5.99±0.36	0.54±0.05	11.16±0.40	6.52±0.72	0.61±0.02
7	7.33±0.52	5.74±0.31	0.34±0.01	10.06±0.13	5.30±0.55	0.42±0.01
8	7.58±0.34	5.11±0.40	0.24±0.01	9.22±0.36	5.01±0.45	0.37±0.02

Comment [i34]: Authors could first display the results of unwashed and then of washed leaves.

Comment [i35]: The numbers in the first column need to be aligned with the rest of the data in table.

135

136

137

138

139

140

141

142

143

144

145

146

147

148

149

150

151

152

153

154

155

From table 2, metal levels in the washed leaves ranged from 7.58±0.34 to 16.57±0.79 for Pb, 5.11±0.40 to 14.40±0.91 for Cr and 0.24±0.01 to 3.62±0.17 for Cd. In the unwashed leaves metal levels ranged from 9.22±0.36 to 19.27±0.40 for Pb, 5.01±0.45 to 15.50±0.40 for Cr and 0.37±0.02 to 3.68±0.25 for Cd. In all cases metal concentrations in both soils and plants decreased as the distance from the centre of the dumpsite increased. The unwashed leaves showed higher metal content than the washed leaves, However the differences were not significant at $p < 0.05$. It should be noted that animals feed on unwashed leaves hence increasing the possibility of heavy metals into the food chain. In the washed and unwashed leaves the heavy metals exceeded WHO safe limits of Pb (2 µg/g), Cr (1.3 µg/g) and Cd (0.02 µg/g) (Mulamu, 2014). From the table, levels decreased as the distance from the center of the dumpsite increased. This means that animals grazing along or inside the dumpsite can accumulate high levels of Pb. The results are in consistent with those found by (Njagi et al., 2017) where levels of lead in *Solanum villosum* grown in Kathondeki dumpsite Waitthaka Kenya decreased as distance from the dumpsite increased. The amount of metal measured in the soil and tobacco tree plants corresponded with the contamination load of the sampling sites. The differentiation of aerial deposits and uptake from the soil was assessed by washing the leaves. From the results there were substantial aerial deposits of heavy metals although it was not statistically significant. Accumulation of heavy metals by plants depends on binding and solubility of particles deposited on the leaves, however, it is difficult to distinguish whether the accumulated elements originate from the soil or from the air through the leaves (Alireza, et al., 2010).

3.3 Heavy Metal Uptake by *Nicotiana glauca graham*.

Comment [i36]: Soils or leaves? Authors should pay attention to this.

Comment [i37]: This sentence is almost the same with one in lines 138-140. Authors should combined these two sentences into one.

Comment [i38]: Unnecessary dot

156

Table 3 shows the levels of the three heavy metals absorbed from the soils by the plants.

157

158

159

Table 3. Comparison of concentrations in the soils and concentrations in tobacco tree plants (µg/g)

Site	Levels in soil			Levels in washed leaves		
	Pb	Cr	Cd	Pb	Cr	Cd
1	1087.11±25.64	183.07±14.11	45.52±4.57	16.57±0.79	14.40±0.91	3.62±0.17
2	983.69±50.94	170.52±14.28	30.67±2.68	14.29±0.85	12.55±0.57	2.34±0.13
3	807.59±59.24	139.13±11.49	19.24±3.24	13.22±0.49	9.95±0.73	2.05±0.09
4	318.64±67.02	119.23±9.80	21.74±1.50	11.76±0.44	8.91±0.38	1.76±0.05

Comment [i39]: Is table 3 necessary? It seems not because it shows comparison of the already presented results from tables 1 and 2. This comparison can be made without table 3, only in the text.

5	226.43±20.12	91.36±5.34	23.37±2.21	9.54±0.56	7.90±0.71	1.31±0.29
6	105.04±12.19	69.43±5.46	19.16±1.35	9.42±0.62	5.99±0.36	0.54±0.05
7	71.47±5.14	47.77±2.16	11.84±1.08	7.33±0.52	5.74±0.31	0.34±0.01
8	41.21±4.03	39.16±2.24	10.27±0.44	7.58±0.34	5.11±0.40	0.24±0.01

160

161 From table 3 above lead had the highest levels in the soils and was also the highest in plants. It was
 162 followed by chromium while cadmium was the lowest. For all the three heavy metals the concentration in
 163 the washed leaves increased with an increase in the soil heavy metal content. Metal concentrations in
 164 both soils and plants decreased as the distance from the centre of dumpsite increased. Many studies
 165 have shown that food crops grown in contaminated soils or when watered with contaminated water
 166 will accumulate trace metals in their tissues hence living a negative impact on the safety of the food
 167 produced (Kr & Bhatt, 2018). Earlier studies on kales have reported high levels on Pb (Njagi et al., 2017).
 168 Cd concentration in plant was significantly different in all plants from different sites the highest
 169 concentration was in site 1 metals concentration increased from Pb, Cr and Cd just like in the soils. The
 170 results are in consistent with those found by (Njagi et al., 2017) where levels of lead in *Solanum villosum*
 171 grown in Kathondeki dumpsite Waithaka Kenya decreased as distance from the dumpsite increased. A
 172 study by (Jung, 2008) through a multiple regression using several factors determined that soil metal
 173 content was the principal determinant of plant tissue metal content. In cases where metal content in the
 174 soil is less than in the plants other metal sources such as dumped items on the spot could be implicated.

Comment [i40]: As it was mentioned earlier, this part of the text can be incorporated before title 3.3. By removing the table 3 there is no need for title 3.3.

175 3.4 Effects of Physicochemical Characteristics on the Transfer of Metals from Soil to 176 Plants

177 A good measure of heavy metal uptake by plants is the transfer factor (T.F). This is the ratio of the
 178 concentration of the heavy metal in a plant to the concentration of the heavy metal in the soil. It signifies
 179 the amount of the heavy metal in the soil that ended up in the plant (Njagi et al., 2017). Transfer factor
 180 was calculated in order to understand the risk and associated hazards due to ingestion consequent upon
 181 heavy metal accumulation in the edible portion of the plant. The transfer factors (T.F) for each heavy
 182 metal were computed based on the method described by (Gandhimathi, 2013). The heavy metal transfer
 183 from soil to plants was calculated as follows.

184

$$\text{Transfer factor} = \frac{\text{metal content in plant}(\mu\text{g/g})}{\text{metal content in soil}(\mu\text{g/g})}$$

Comment [i41]: This equation should be written in Mat type or other program and not attached as picture.

185 Tables 4, 5 and 6 shows effects of pH and TOC on the metal uptake by plants
 186
 187

188 **Table. 4 Effects of pH and TOC on Transfer of Lead**

Comment [i42]: It would be good to join in tables 5 and 6 below the table 4, to be one table, especially since Authors discuss about all three metals together (text in lines 190-205).

Site	Soil pH	TOC	Levels in Washed leaves (µg/g)	Levels in the soil (µg/g)	Transfer Factor
1	6.21±0.04	15.02 ±0.40	16.57±0.79	1087.11±25.64	0.02
2	5.92±0.13	14.03 ±0.23	14.29±0.85	983.69±50.94	0.02
3	6.50 ±0.36	12.14 ±0.72	13.22±0.49	807.59±59.24	0.02
4	6.50 ±0.04	11.57 ±0.55	11.76±0.44	318.64±67.02	0.04

5	6.94 ±0.40	9.59 ±0.45	9.54±0.56	226.43±20.12	0.05
6	6.55 ±0.36	9.12 ±0.31	9.42±0.62	105.04±12.19	0.06
7	6.54 ±0.34	11.80 ±0.40	7.33±0.52	71.47±5.14	0.11
8	6.01 ±0.13	8.72 ±0.40	7.58±0.34	41.21±4.03	0.11

Comment [i43]: It should be aligned with rest of the data in table.

189

190 Soil pH ranged from 5.92±0.13 to 6.94 ±0.40 but did not show any particular pattern within the sites.
 191 However, the soils were acidic. TOC ranged from 8.72 ±0.40 to 15.02 ±0.4 and it increased with a
 192 decrease in distance from the centre of the dumpsite. Transfer factor ranged from 0.02 to 0.11. The
 193 results revealed that the higher the soil metal level, the lower the transfer ratio. Bioavailability and toxicity
 194 of metals in soils was significantly influenced by pH of the soil. Soil pH is considered to be one of the
 195 most important factors that influence transfer of Pb and Cd from soil to plant. Higher pH values have been
 196 found to reduce bioavailability and toxicity of Pb and Cd. pH values ranged from 6.01 ±0.13 to 6.94
 197 ±0.40 this suggests that the dumpsite soils are weakly acidic. It has been shown that solubility of metals
 198 increase along with a decrease in soil pH (Fytianos, et al., 2001). Due to low pH in the dumpsite soils the
 199 availability of heavy metals to plants was at its highest. From table 4, lead accumulation into the leaves
 200 increase with an increase in the organic matter, this was the case for Cr and Cd. Organic compounds
 201 can dissolve lightly bound forms of heavy metals resulting in the increase of element uptake by
 202 plants (Trevisan et al., 2010). For lead the results agrees with other researchers (Teka et al., 2018).
 203 Ironically TOC can also reduce bioavailability of heavy metals in soils by absorption or forming
 204 stable complexes with humic substances though this will depend on other factors (Liu, et al., 2009).
 205 Similar results of effect of TOC were obtained by (Mbong et al., 2014 and Lasat, 2000).

Comment [i44]: Is this concluded from the obtained results? Or this is concluded based on findings in the literature? Then it should be supported by the relevant references.

206 **Table 5. Effect of pH and TOC on Transfer of Chromium**

Site	Soil pH	TOC	Levels in Washed leaves (µg/g)	Levels in the soil (µg/g)	Transfer Factor
1	6.21±0.04	15.02 ±0.40	14.40±0.91	183.07±14.11	0.03
2	5.92±0.13	14.03 ±0.23	12.55±0.57	170.52±14.28	0.02
3	6.50 ±0.36	12.14 ±0.72	9.95±0.73	139.13±11.49	0.02
4	6.50 ±0.04	11.57 ±0.55	8.91±0.38	119.23±9.80	0.02
5	6.94 ±0.40	9.59 ±0.45	7.90±0.71	91.36±5.34	0.02
6	6.55 ±0.36	9.12 ±0.31	5.99±0.36	69.43±5.46	0.01

207

208 Although chromium had relatively high levels in the soils, it had the lowest transfer factor ratios. This
 209 shows that the threat of environmental pollution by chromium is the lowest. This could be attributed to the
 210 fact that a high percentage of it is held in the mineral matrix showing that it is largely immobile and less
 211 available to plants (Bongoua-devisme et al., 2018).

212 **Table 6. Effect of pH and TOC on Transfer of Cadmium**

Site	Soil pH	TOC	Levels in Washed leaves (µg/g)	Levels in the soil (µg/g)	Transfer Factor
1	6.21±0.04	15.02 ±0.40	3.62±0.17	45.52±4.57	0.49

2	5.92±0.13	14.03 ±0.23	2.34±0.13	30.67±2.68	0.57
3	6.50 ±0.36	12.14 ±0.72	2.05±0.09	19.24±3.24	0.70
4	6.50 ±0.04	11.57 ±0.55	1.76±0.05	21.74±1.50	0.66
5	6.94 ±0.40	9.59 ±0.45	1.31±0.29	23.37±2.21	0.52
6	6.55 ±0.36	9.12 ±0.31	0.54±0.05	19.16±1.35	0.64
7	6.54 ±0.34	11.80 ±0.40	0.34±0.01	11.84±1.08	0.66
8	6.01 ±0.13	8.72 ±0.40	0.24±0.01	10.27±0.44	0.77

213
214 Although cadmium had the lowest levels in the plants, it had the highest transfer factor ratios this reveals
215 that cadmium was the most mobile and bioavailable among the three metals. This shows that it can easily
216 be transferred into the food chain through uptake by plants growing in the soils or any other mechanism
217 Studies have also revealed lower levels of cadmium in spinach grown near motor garages in Nairobi.
218

219 3.5 Pearson Correlation Coefficients of Concentration of Metals in the Soils with 220 Concentration in the Washed Plant Leaves.

221 Total concentration of the Pb, Cr and Cd was correlated with the concentration in the leaves of *Nicotiana*
222 *spp* and the results tabulated in table 7.

223 Table 7. Pearson Correlation Coefficients of total Pb, Cr and Cd with the Washed Leaves 224 of *Nicotiana spp*.

Metal	Pearson Correlation	P-value
Pb	0.971	<0.001
Cd	0.909	0.002
Cr	0.971	<0.001

225

226 There was a strong positive relationship between the amount of metal ions in the soil with metal ion in the
227 plant ($P < 0.05$ Pearson correlation). This showed that an increase in heavy metal concentrations lead to
228 an increase in absorption of metals by plants. It also suggested that the dumpsite soil was the sink for
229 heavy metals leading to their entry into the food chain. These results were in agreement with (Katana
230 Chengo, 2013 and Wyszowski, 2014).

231 4. Conclusions

232 The results obtained from the analysis of Dandora dumpsite soils indicates that the total concentrations of
233 lead, chromium and cadmium were far much higher than typical soil metal contents. The levels of lead
234 chromium and cadmium in the nearby Tobacco tree plants were far much higher than the WHO
235 acceptable limits. Presence of these metals in the plants was an indicator of their mobility and
236 bioavailability. Based from the results obtained from this study, total concentrations of lead, chromium
237 and cadmium in the plants around the dumpsite are high hence the need for control measures and set up
238 of regulations to govern the dumping of municipal waste in the dumpsite. Due to the effects of the
239 dumpsite on the high population living near the dumpsite, it should be relocated into a less populated
240 area. Grazing of animals inside or near the dumpsite as well as farming of vegetables inside or near the

Comment [i45]: Unnecessary dot

Comment [i46]: It should be italicized.

Comment [i47]: There are too big spaces in the rows of the table, they could be reduced.

Comment [i48]: It should be italicized.

Comment [i49]: Unnecessary dot

Comment [i50]: What exactly represents P-value? Where are the references which support this value? What is the difference between T.F. and P-value, it is not clear?

Comment [i51]: indicate

241 dumpsite should be stopped. Use of dumpsite waste as manure by farmers living near the dumpsite
242 should be highly discouraged.

243 **COMPETING INTERESTS**

244 Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

245

246 **REFERENCES**

- 247 1. Alireza Pourkhabbaz, Nayerah Rastin, Andrea Olbrich, R. L.-H. and A. P. (2010). Influence of
248 Environmental Pollution on Leaf Properties of Urban Plane Trees, *Platanus orientalis* L. *Springer*, 251–
249 255.
- 250 2. Awokunmi, E. E., Asaolu, S. S., & Ipinmoroti, K. O. (2010). Effect of leaching on heavy metals
251 concentration of soil in some dumpsites. *African Journal of Environmental Science and Technology*,
252 4(August), 495–499.
- 253 3. Bongoua-devisme, A., Bi, E. B., Kassin, K., Gueable, Y., Adiaffi, B., Yao-kouame, A., ... Gueable, Y.
254 (2018). Assessment of heavy metal contamination degree of municipal open-air dumpsite on
255 surrounding soils : Case of dumpsite of Bonoua , Ivory Coast. *International Journal of Engineering*
256 *Research and General Science*, 6(5), 28–42.
- 257 4. Esakku, S., Selvam, A., Joseph, K., Esakku, S., Selvam, A., Joseph, K., & Palanivelu, K. (2015).
258 Assessment of heavy metal species in decomposed municipal solid waste. *Taylor and Francis*,
259 2299, 95–102.
- 260 5. F.B.G. Tane and T.N.Eshalomi-Mario. (2015). Heavy Metal Contents in Plants and Soils in
261 Abandoned Solid Waste Dumpsites in Port Harcourt , Nigeria. *Research Journal of Environmental*
262 *Toxicology*, 9(6), 342–349.
- 263 6. Fytianos, K., Katsianis, G., Triantafyllou, P., & Zachariadis, G. (2001). Accumulation of Heavy Metals in
264 Vegetables Grown in an Industrial Area in Relation to Soil. *Environmental Contamination and*
265 *Toxicology*, (May), 423–430.
- 266 7. G.Kimani, N. (2007). *ENVIRONMENTAL POLLUTION AND IMPACT TO PUBLIC HEALTH*.
- 267 8. Gandhimathi, S. K. R. (2013). Assessment of heavy metal contamination in soil due to leachate
268 migration from an open dumping site. *Springer Nature*, 193–205.
- 269 9. Iyakwari, J., Agbajelola, D. O., Farrow, T. S., & Eterigho, E. J. (2016). Assessment of Heavy Metal
270 Contamination on Dumpsite in Kuyi Village , Niger State , Nigeria. *Int'l Journal of Research in*
271 *Chemical, Metallurgical and Civil Eng.* 3(1), 42–44.
- 272 10. Jung, M. C. (2008). Heavy Metal Concentrations in Soils and Factors Affecting Metal Uptake by
273 Plants in the Vicinity of a Korean Cu-W Mine. *MDPI*, 2413–2423.
- 274 11. Katana Chengo, M. J. and M. H. (2013). Speciation of Chromium and Nickel in Open-Air Automobile
275 Mechanic Workshop Soils in Ngara , Nairobi , Kenya. *World Environment*, 3(5), 143–154.
- 276 12. Kr, A., & Bhatt, G. M. A. (2018). Effect of long-term application of treated sewage water on heavy
277 metal accumulation in vegetables grown in Northern India. *Springer*, (2012), 1025–1036.
- 278 13. Lasat, M. M. (2000). PHYTOEXTRACTION OF METALS FROM CONTAMINATED SOIL: A
279 REVIEW OF PLANT / SOIL / METAL INTERACTION AND ASSESSMENT OF PERTINENT
280 AGRONOMIC ISSUES. *Journal of Hazardous Substance Research*, 2(198), 1–25.
- 281 15. Liu, L., Chen, H., Cai, P., Liang, W., & Huang, Q. (2009). Immobilization and phytotoxicity of Cd in
282 contaminated soil amended with chicken manure compost. *Journal of Hazardous Materials*, 163,
283 563–567.
- 284 16. M.A.Opasina, G. O. A. and. (2010). Physicochemical and Heavy Metals Assessments of Leachates
285 from Aperin Abandoned Dumpsite in Ibadan City , Nigeria. *E-Journal of Chemistry*, 7(4), 1278–1283.
- 286 17. Mbong, E.O., Akpan, E.E and Osu, S. . (2014). Soil-plant heavy metal relations and transfer factor
287 index of habitats densely distributed with *Citrus reticulata* (tangerine). *Journal of Research in*
288 *Environmental Science and Toxicology*, 3(4), 61–65.
- 289 18. Mulamu, L. O. (2014). Heavy metal contamination of land and water around the Nairobi City Dandora
290 dumpsite , Kenya. *Spring Journal*, 2(9), 360–367.
- 291 19. N, A.-S. (2009). Assessment of Heavy Metals Pollution in Dumpsites in Ilorin Metropolis. *Ethiopian*
292 *Journal of Environmental Studies and Management*, 2(2), 92–99.
- 293 20. Njagi, J. M., Akunga, D. N., Njagi, M. M., Ngugi, M. P., & Njagi, E. M. N. (2017). Heavy Metal

Comment [i52]: The reference list must be revised to be equalized in regard the first name or the surname of the Authors - what appear first?

Moreover, several references that appear in the text are not present in reference list.

Also, references 16 and 19 are present in the reference list but I do not see them in the text.

This all must be corrected.

- 294 Concentration in Vegetables Grown around Dumpsites in Nairobi City County , Kenya. *World*
295 *Environment*, 7(2), 49–56.
- 296 21. Olanrewaju, O. O. O. and O. . (2019). An Investigation into Heavy Metal Contamination of Soils and
297 Streams around Solid Waste Dump Sites in Ado Ekiti , Ekiti State , Nigeria . *International Journal of*
298 *Agriculture and Environmental Research*, (2), 44–55.
- 299 22. Olayiwola, H. A., & Azeez, M. O. (2017). Heavy Metal Contents in Soil and Plants at Dumpsites : A
300 Case Study of Awotan and Ajakanga Dumpsite Ibadan , Oyo State ,Nigeria. *Journal of Environment*
301 *and Earth Science*, 7(4), 11–24.
- 302 23. Teka, A., Wogi, L., Nigatu, L., & Habib, K. (2018). Assessment of Heavy Metals in Municipal Solid
303 Waste Dumpsite in Harar City , Harari Regional State , Ethiopia. *International Journal for Research*
304 *in Applied Science & Engineering Technology*, 6, 2570–2580.
- 305 24. Trevisan, S., Francioso, O., Quaggiotti, S., & Nardi, S. (2010). From environmental aspects to
306 molecular factors Humic substances biological activity at the plant-soil interface. *Plant Signaling &*
307 *Behavior*, 5(6), 635–643.
- 308 25. Wyszowski, B. M. & M. (2014). Trace metals content in soils along the state road 51 (northeastern
309 Poland). *Springer Nature*, 51, 2589–2597.
- 310