



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Soil Science and Plant Nutrition
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJSSPN_51071
Title of the Manuscript:	IMPACT OF THE MIXTURE OF WATER FROM COOKED BEAN AND HUMAN URINE ON THE GROWTH OF SOME COMMON PLANTS IN CAMEROON: CASE STUDY OF Talinum fruticosum and Ocimum gratissimum
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	<p>Study subject: 161 plants of Talinum fruticosum and 161 plants of Ocimum gratissimum were regularly treated with a mixture of human urine and water from cooked beans (Phaseolus vulgaris) in a 1:1 ratio during three months.</p> <p>Objective: test the mixture made of human urine and water from cooked beans on plants in order to verify their efficacy on plants growth and crop yield.</p> <p>Goal: Peasants could thus save a lot of money by using their excreta and some of their sewages as fertilizers to promote the sustainable development of their ecosystems.</p> <p>The Urine is a liquid feces content of high quantity of nitrogen, phosphorus, potassium, and calcium easily absorbable by plants is known and used in the agriculture in several thousands of years around the globe. No heavy metals stated as reference. Water from cooked beans is rich in chemical elements concentrated in the beans seeds according to the response of soils treated with that fluid, pH values range between 6 and 6.5. Two fluids mixed in the 1:1 ratio, implying one part of human urine for one part of water from cooked beans. The pH value of that mixture was 6.85.</p> <p>Result: The stems of plants that have grown on fertilized soils are more resistant under finger pressure than that of the control. This mixture is then a way of sustainable improvement of the yield of these two plants highly used as food and medicines for the peasants who grow them.</p> <p>COMMENT:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. using excreta and some of sewages as fertilizers has been known in 1000's of years = lack of Novelty 2. Key important analytics of the materials used is missing. 3. However in modern age the main and critical challenge in the sewage agri use are the pharma residuals and pathogenic infections, incl. resistant microbes. NONE OF THEM DISCUSSED. 4. No any environmental/ecological impact assessment made. 5. Risk assessment is missing 	
Minor REVISION comments	Need to be reworked and updated to meet modern age knowledge level.	
Optional/General comments		



[SDI Review Form 1.6](#)

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	<i>Edward Someus</i>
Department, University & Country	<i>Hungary</i>